

AN INTERDISCIPLINARY ARTISTIC INQUIRY
WITHIN THE PERFORMATIVE PARADIGM

by

ALLISON UPSHAW

DIANE SEKERES, CHAIR

CRAIG SHWERY, CO-CHAIR

ROBIN BOYLORN

ANDREW DEWAR

KELLY GUYOTTE

CATHERINE ROACH

A DISSERTATION

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the
Department of Curriculum and Instruction
in the Graduate School of
The University of Alabama

TUSCALOOSA, ALABAMA

2017

Copyright Allison Upshaw 2017
ALL RIGHTS RESERVED

ABSTRACT

The three articles in this dissertation reveal and explore how the arts have and can be used in the academy for research purposes. The Arts-Based Research (ABR) strand probes disciplinary specialties, the performing artist strand locates the researcher, and the interdisciplinarity strand binds conceptual frameworks into a braid that knowingly continues to strengthen itself for other uses. We begin by learning about the ways in which other researchers have employed arts-based methods in a variety of disciplinary research projects. Next, we look at the ways in which the arts can be used in teacher training programs, and finally a practical investigation of how different artistic practices can reveal understanding not available through standard inquiry methods.

Set in an imaginary television studio with the researcher as host, the first article introduces the audience to Dance, Drama, Music, and Visual Art as they speak about various roles they have played in academic research. Guests introduce themselves by giving a little background on a few of the ways they have been recognized and utilized in ABR projects. The format of the show is very relaxed with the guests feeling free to ask the hosts questions about her own role in ABR projects.

The second article creatively (re)presents a case study of 20 preservice teachers exploring the use of dance as an instructional strategy for classroom teachers. The article is based on information collected from participant and researcher journal entries, field memos, and discussions. Scattered throughout are examples of data collection designed to draw the reading

audience into the research process, while strands of aesthetic meaning-making, teaching artistry, and critical performance autoethnography are braided throughout the article in order to reflect, analyze, and embody the resulting narrative.

The final article of this trilogy layers the use of drama, music, dance, and visual spectacle in an effort to uncover understandings that cannot be determined through traditional scientific procedures. Selected data from the second article is used as the foundation for a multilayered artistic investigation. Unlike the other articles, which display single strand connections to each interdisciplinary set, this article is a reflection of the totality of those groups. This article incorporates the interdisciplinary, critical performative autoethnography, and performative paradigms, which I have detailed as the conceptual frameworks through which I move. It displays the disciplinary specialties of my degree: aesthetic meaning-making, performance, and arts-based research methods; finally, it incorporates my location as artist, researcher, and teacher.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Thank you God...

for Mama (Alice A. Upshaw) and Bigma (Clara M. Adams).

Thank you God...

for Dr. Sekeres. Her patience knows no bounds.

Thank you God...

for Dr. Goodliffe. He saw something in me that I only guessed existed.

Thank you God...

for my Committee. They all supported me on this journey with little understanding of the final destination.

Thank you God...

for my Facebook Hive Mind, collective knowledge is powerful.

Thank you God...

for all those who prayed and wished me well. You'll never know how much I relied on you.

Thank you God...

for all the colored girls who've gone before me and paved the way in blood, sweat, and tears.

CONTENTS

ABSTRACT.....	ii
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	iv
LIST OF TABLES.....	viii
INTRODUCTION	1
Disciplinary Thirds	2
Strand 1: Aesthetic Meaning-making	2
Strand 2: Performance.....	2
Strand 3: Arts-Based Research Methods	3
Artist Researcher Teacher Triad.....	3
Strand 1: Performing Artist.....	4
Strand 2: Researcher	4
Strand 3: Teacher	4
Conceptual Frameworks Trio	5
Strand 1: Interdisciplinarity	5
Strand 2: Performative Paradigm.....	6
Strand 3: Critical Performative Autoethnography	8
A LITERARY CONVERSATION: THE TALK SHOW	10
References.....	39
WHO KILLED COCK ROBIN: AESTHETIC MEANING-MAKING IN PRESERVICE TEACHER TRAINING.....	43
Reconstructed/Collapsed Memory.....	43

The Study	44
Data collection and analysis.....	45
Research questions.....	47
Representation.....	48
Situating the Researcher	49
Data Collection: Reconstructed/Collapsed Memory	52
Arts Integration: Instruction.....	54
Data Collection: Reconstructed/Collapsed Memory	56
Arts Integration: Method.....	57
Data Collection: Jottings.....	58
Awareness and Understandings	58
Data Collection: Observation Notes	62
Musings.....	62
Revisioning	64
Addendum.....	65
References.....	66
 L’OPERA: LAYERED OPERATIONS PRATCISING EMBODIMENT REFLECTION AND ANALYSIS	 69
Layer 1–Text.....	72
Layer 2—Music	76
Poetry/Drumming Line 1	80
Poetry/Drumming Line 2	80
Poetry/Drumming Line 3	81

Poetry/Drumming Line 4	81
Poetry/Drumming Line 5	81
Layer 3—Dance	82
Body	82
Energy	83
Space	84
Time	85
Layer 4—Visual Spectacle	86
Conclusion	89
References	93
CONCLUSION: CACOPHONY	97
REFERENCES	99
APPENDIX A: IRB APPROVAL	102

LIST OF TABLES

1. Original Texts for the Found Poems.....	73
2. Analysis of Select Words and Phrases of Importance or Impact.....	74
3. Researcher's Poem.....	75
4. Participant's Poem	75
5. Advisor's Poem.....	76

INTRODUCTION

In Ecclesiastes (New International Version), Chapter 4, verse 13b is, “A cord of three strands is not quickly broken.” In like manner, the cord of this dissertation braids three articles together, reflecting three differing strands of connectivity to the researcher: three disciplinary interests; three conceptual frameworks; and three wells of information (artist, researcher, teacher). The three disciplinary interests: aesthetic meaning-making, performance, and arts-based research methods connect me to my interdisciplinary studies degree. The second triad locates me within the academy as performing artist, researcher, and teacher, and reveals how this location habituates the articles. The final trio discussed in this introduction describes the three conceptual frameworks that influenced my research and my representation of findings in the individual works: interdisciplinarity, the performative paradigm, and critical performative autoethnography.

The articles are all written in a creative nonfiction format. Narrative nonfiction, also known as creative nonfiction, is a storied approach to research. It brings together researched content with conventions of fictional storytelling to thoroughly engage the reader (Sinner, 2013). In the context of this writing, my use of creative nonfiction rises from the interstitial and interdisciplinary spaces of autoethnography (Ellis, 2004), performative writing (Pollock, 1998), and narrative inquiry (Clandinin & Connelly, 2004). It is creative in form and craft, but the information and events are completely factual (Gutkind, 2012). In fact, Gutkind sums up the genre simply as true stories well told (Williams, 2010). Finally, the study concludes with a

poetic summation of the material presented, musings on future possibilities for growth in my disciplinary areas of interest, and discussion on further situating myself within the academy.

Disciplinary Thirds

Interdisciplinarity, requiring a minimum of two disciplines, is a crossing of disciplinary borders in search of knowledge as yet unknown. The disciplines listed here work in, with, and through each other in the following articles.

Strand 1: Aesthetic Meaning-making

Aesthetic meaning-making is most clearly seen in the article, *Who Really Killed Cock Robin*. The term aesthetic meaning-making is used to emphasize the process involved in incorporating the arts into classroom activities. Readers are invited into a case study (Stake, 1995; Yin, 2003) with 20 participants from a preservice teachers' training program. Through my practice as a teaching artist (Booth, 2013; Jaffe, Barniskis, & Cox, 2013), I borrow elements of autoethnography (Boylorn & Orbe, 2014; Ellis & Bochner, 2006) and narrative inquiry (Chase, 2011; Clandinin & Connelly, 2004) to explore how pre-service, classroom teachers can use aesthetic tools to help their students make meaning from their reading. By using autoethnography, a qualitative research method moving from introspective awareness to generalization of understandings within a larger group (Ellis, 2004), I reflect on my location as researcher inside the research process in order to improve my work as a teaching artist. I use narrative inquiry here as defined by Leavy (2014). It is an "umbrella category for a variety of arts-based methodological practices involving storytelling and writing" (p. 26).

Strand 2: Performance

The word performance varies in meaning from context to context. "Performance is a verb" (Gray, 2003, p. 254). "Performance is the explanation and explication of life itself"

(Turner, 1986a, p. 21). “All the world’s a stage and all the men and women merely players” (Shakespeare, 2.7.6). By engaging the broadest definition of performance in *L’OPERA: Layered Practices Embodying Reflection and Analysis*, I encourage myself to stretch beyond the rigid definitions of conservatory training. Releasing my preconceived notions of what performance is allows me the ability to experience performance without boundaries and across disciplines.

Strand 3: Arts-Based Research Methods

Arts-based research, according to McNiff (1998a), is the “systematic use of the artistic process...as a primary way of understanding and examining experience by both researchers and the people they involve in their studies” (p. 29). Through the lens of arts-based research (Barone & Eisner, 2012; Irwin & Springgay, 2008; Leavy, 2014; Nelson, 2013) in its various forms, I can examine the familiar through new eyes. *A Literary Conversation: The Talk Show* uses the form of a dramatic script to discuss research in and through the arts. In this article, the arts-based research method is a way of examining the new through familiar eyes. Arts-based research methods as a disciplinary specialty interest me in the specific way each art form can impact data collection, analysis, and understanding. As an interdisciplinary artist through embodied practice, the ability to include my skills and strengths as an artist strengthens my work as a researcher.

Artist Researcher Teacher Triad

I self-identify as a performing artist. More specifically, I self-identify as an opera singer, and for this study I add my identities as researcher and teacher. How I locate and write myself inside the research process strengthens the strand of the autoethnographic (Pace, 2012; Weber, 2014) in my work.

Strand 1: Performing Artist

Performing artist is not a surface definition, but rather something intricately braided into my personal sense of self. I have been formally training in the arts since I was six years old. Piano, dance, guitar, voice, acting, saxophone, recorder, all ways in which I have participated in the arts from childhood to adulthood. My life as a performing artist is not something I bring from research. It is a lived experience that shapes who I am (Ellis & Bochner, 2006; Griffiths, 2011). It is this self, the self that existed before I entered the academy, that I bring to my creative work as an academic researcher in the article *L'OPERA*. My self-designation as a performing artist located within the academy drives my work as a researcher. It is the foundation of my strengths in arts-based research.

Strand 2: Researcher

Locating myself as an interdisciplinary arts-based researcher allows me to cross boundaries in a myriad of ways. I have explored disciplinary connectors with trauma studies and music (Upshaw, 2017a), black feminism and dance (Upshaw, 2017b), transnational adoption and poetry (Upshaw, 2018a), as well as place attachment theory and documentary film (Upshaw, 2018b). *Who Really Killed Cock Robin* stands out in this strand in that my location is guided by relationship to others.

Strand 3: Teacher

For 17 years, I have worked as a teaching artist in arts integration. That led me to my initial interest in the arts as an instructional strategy for classroom teachers. That is the foundation of the case study entitled *Who Really Killed Cock Robin*. The teacher in me also comes through in *L'OPERA* as I walk the reading audience step by step through the investigative process.

Conceptual Frameworks Trio

The following concepts of interdisciplinarity, performative paradigms, and critical performance autoethnography are the supporting frameworks (Jabareen, 2009) by which my work is bounded.

Strand 1: Interdisciplinarity

As in all single disciplines, interdisciplinarity means different things to those working within its boundaries. Graff (2015) has concerned himself with the fluidity of interdisciplinarity. He stated that it does not come in a single form and must be allowed to evolve as needed by the specific research process (p. 3). Repko (2012) has insisted that the most important thing to remember about interdisciplinary work is that the disciplines themselves are not under scrutiny. For him, the importance of interdisciplinarity lies with the what; that is, the question that is to be addressed, and not with the how; that is, combined disciplines.

Ausburg (2006) shared what she defined as a symbiotic relationship between discipline and practice. Disciplines are shaped by practice, and practice then shapes the discipline. It is a cycle of influence and inquiry seeming to mirror that of creative inquiry cycles. Newell (1998) emphasized the practical importance of understanding the discipline before initiating an interdisciplinary process. I instinctually understood this in my efforts to learn everything about my roles as artist, researcher, and teacher prior to entering the research site. From Repko's work (2012), I take a name for myself, and my work. I am what he calls an *integrationist interdisciplinarian*. As such, I approach interdisciplinary work with full integration as the hallmark of success. This commitment to integration stems from years of training under the direction of the John F. Kennedy Center for the Performing Arts. Their definition of arts

integration provides the foundation upon which I founded my ideas of how the arts should be used in the classroom.

Arts integration is an approach to teaching [researching, and representing] in which students [arts-based researchers] can construct and demonstrate knowledge through an art form. Students [arts-based researchers] engage in a creative process which connects an art form and another subject, meeting evolving objectives in both. (Silverstein & Layne, 2010, para. 3)

In parentheses, I have added my broadened understanding of the integrative practices with which I engage and perhaps laid a path that others may follow. The visualization that I use for arts integration is that of a James Bond car. It is fully car and can be fully submarine without sacrificing the true nature of either. Yet, they are both present and intact at all times. This is my goal for arts integration in the classroom, in my research, and in my writing.

Strand 2: Performative Paradigm

Leavy (2014) has spoken of arts-based practice as problematic and troubling for the qualitative paradigm (p. 9). She compared this troubling of the qualitative standard to the similar process that qualitative researchers went through while establishing themselves outside of the quantitative point of view. However, some researchers think that the troubles experienced by arts-based researchers is because they are trying to establish a fit where there is none.

The idea of the performative paradigm is based on Austin's (1975) definition of performativity in words. In Austin's work, there are some words that not only tell or describe an action. Indeed, the inherent power in these specific words is the power to bring into existence what did not exist before their utterance. An example of the performativity of words would be when the bride and groom say "I do" in a marriage ceremony. The power of those words ushers in a change of status. It is immediate. It is personal. It is also a social and emotional creation. Its impact is immediate.

The performative paradigm (Bolt, 2008; Haseman, 2006; Nelson, 2013), as described by Bolt, separates itself from the traditional dichotomy of qualitative and quantitative work primarily through its view of practice and the removal of written text as the primary conveyance of understanding. Haseman posited that the qualitative paradigm with its focus on the observation of human practices and the quantitative paradigm's measured observations of the same are more similar than different due to their stance of practice as something to be observed. He (2006) stated that in the performative paradigm practice is not only something to be observed, but is also a method of the observation itself (p. 2).

Bolt (2008) suggested that both the quantitative and qualitative research processes begin with constative statements that seek to represent truth based on facts, while this new paradigm follows Austin's definition of the word performative and is a part of the truth that a performative researcher seeks and the facts that lead them to that understanding.

A traditional research project, in either the qualitative or quantitative paradigms, is designed to provide answers to a question devised by the researcher (Clandinin & Connelly, 2004; Mason, 2002; Repko, 2012; Yin, 2003). With practice as research (Bolt, 2008; Nelson, 2013; Haseman, 2006; Smith & Dean, 2009), all projects may not begin at the same starting point. More likely a practice as research (PaR) project begins with an idea that stimulates the researcher's interest. While the boundaries of this text do not permit extensive exploration of this positioning, or its possible differentiation from qualitative and arts-based research, I choose to align myself within this framework because it resonates with my way of knowing and moving through the world—ways that are not always grounded in academic boundaries.

Strand 3: Critical Performative Autoethnography

Autoethnography, (Ellis, 2004) describes an investigation into the personal and its relationship to the broader scope of humanity. Boylorn's (2013) use of race, class, and gender influenced my understanding of how my personal placement, in each of these areas, further influences my understanding of the world. Anne Harris and Stacy Holmann-Jones (2016), Snowber (2012), and Spry (2001) added a performative understanding and facilitated my further commitment to this brand of ethnographic inquiry. Within a narrative framework, autoethnography takes the research puzzle (Mason, 2002) two steps further by asking "why me," and then expanding to "why us." In the words of Clandinin and Connelly (2000), we take a three dimensional approach to our narrative lives: inward/outward, backward/forward, and situated within a place.

Good autoethnography begins with a collection of the researcher's life experiences. These life experiences are then woven into a story, captivating an audience with its inward/backward focus. It is a methodological framework; itself being framed within narrative rooms of qualitative research. Critical autoethnography grabs that captivating story from the singleness of its initial telling and, through intense examination, places it within the context of a greater knowing, now moving outward/forward.

Critical performative autoethnography embodies this storied knowledge of self and enacts the knowledge of self in relation to other, situating this artist/researcher/teacher/scholar firmly in the present world, critically analyzing the past in order to improve the future. For example, when dancers are taught how to complete turns, they are introduced to the term spotting. They are told to pick an object/place/thing in front of them on which they should focus all their attention. Their head should be the last thing to turn, keeping the object in sight until the last

moment, and when they lose sight of it in the turn, it should be the first thing they seek as their bodies return to the forward facing position. This is called spotting, and dancers use it to keep from getting dizzy as they dazzle their audience with an amazing number of turns. In the constant shifting and multiple turns found in the integration of various disciplines, autoethnography is how I *spot*.

A LITERARY CONVERSATION:

THE TALK SHOW

ALLISON

Good Evening Ladies and Gentlemen. Welcome to *A Literary Conversation!*

(recorded applause.)

Tonight I have a very special program for you. A few weeks ago, we introduced the idea of a performative paradigm. Do you remember? I said that the qualitative paradigm, in a major shift from the quantitative worldview, includes the researcher's voice as an integral part of the research process. My own research often includes the intersectional layers of race, gender, and class (Crenshaw, 1989) combined with interdisciplinary tendencies and artistic training that fuel a personal performative paradigm.

Haseman (2006) defines this performative paradigm as a worldview outside the quantitative and qualitative dichotomy. According to Haseman, these traditional paradigms, quantitative and qualitative, are not as different as they have claimed to be, since they both are based on the concept of "practice as an object of observation rather than a method of research" (Haseman, 2006, p. 74). In his description of the performative paradigm, practice itself becomes the research method, a way of

generating and processing inquiries as well as disseminating findings.

Tonight I have a representative from each of the art forms here to share how they have been used within arts-based research processes. I hope my guests will take this opportunity to

- Define disciplinary vocabulary and
- Share both a general rationale for the use of the arts in research.

I also hope we have time to include some of my personal experiences and questions working with each genre.

I don't want to be the only voice that you hear, so, without further ado, Dance, would you be so kind as to introduce yourself, and tell us a little about dance as a research process?

DANCE

Thank you so much for having me on the show. Let me say first of all that I think that inviting the body into the research arena is a rather subversive act. How so? It begins with the philosophical musings of Rene Descartes (1596-1650). He determined the mind to be responsible for thinking, and that the body was not needed in that process. According to Descartes (Descartes, Cottingham, Stoothoff, & Murdoch, 1984), the only certain thing is to think, which is the arena of the mind. The body can only know through the senses and those cannot be trusted, therefore knowledge connected to the body cannot be trusted. This has been the foundation of Western philosophical thought through modern times. Consequently,

using the body in the creation, pursuit, or sharing of knowledge flies defiantly in the face of Descartes' defined separation of mind and body.

I personally love the fact that arts-based researchers do not shy away from the idea of sensory knowledge as a valid way of understanding the world. They have no problem pushing the boundaries of traditional understanding by turning this question on its ear, and asking unapologetically what can a body know? How does the embodiment of research practices inform the research practice?

Kinesthetic ways of knowing as a research tool are often less about a specific aesthetic discipline. Learning and knowing through the body is open to include smaller, less skilled gestures and creative expressions (Snowber, 2012). More importantly, it is more than performance. It is also a performative public pedagogy effecting social change, according to Markula (2006) in an echo of Denzin's ideology (2003). It embodies the researcher's access to knowledge, shapes the form of that knowledge, and plays an important role in the dissemination of that knowledge. It is one of the most difficult art forms through which to pursue academic knowledge (Bagey & Cancienne, 2002) because of its ephemeral nature (Leavy, 2014). However, like all ABR methods, it potentially raises consciousness, creates and promotes empathy, reveals patterns, and communicates narratives. In describing the body as a site of knowledge, Cancienne and Snowber (2009) have used dance as a way to pose critical

questions, connect with the emotions of participants, understand theoretical concepts, and understand self as a place of discovery. As part of a research process, it is visual, often musical, and can be based on text. While I have been the object of study by anthropologists for years (Sklar, 1991; Welsh-Asante, 1997), it has only been recently that I have moved from being the object of study to a research methodology (Jones, 1997; Sklar, 1991; Snowber, 2012; Spry, 2001).

Even though my intrinsically abstract nature can be a deterrent for researchers, I can be used to create empathy, educate, inform, and provide an embodied perspective for viewers/readers otherwise unseen in traditional research presentations and dissemination processes (Leavy, 2014). Allison, I have a question for you though before we go any further. I heard you mention to someone, off set, that you consider yourself a practice as research, or PaR scholar? How does that differ from an Arts-based Researcher? Is there a difference?

ALLISON

That's a great question, Dance! Thank you for asking me to clarify that. What is an arts based researcher, and are all artists researchers? No, not in the way that higher education defines that term. Artistic researchers are those who use their art intentionally as a vehicle and as a space for research to be carried out (Little, 2011). Unlike other qualitative researchers, and even some visual artist researchers, performative artist-

scholars initiate the research puzzle (Clandinin & Connelly, 2004) from a vastly different perspective.

I prefer the term practice as research scholar over ABR for the simple reason that PaR work seems to emphasize the performative art forms. PaR scholarship often follows my own personal research process by not usually starting with a specific problem. They start with an interest. Performative researchers are often not interested in translating their work into more standard forms of representation. Most performative researchers feel that true knowledge of the nature of their inquiry, or the knowledge derived from their inquiry is not fully understood if the (re) presentation is not of the same or similar form as the inquiry itself (Haseman, 2006). In other words, much is or can, be lost in the transference to text from an art based inquiry. This does not mean that textual, or text based representations are completely rejected by PaR practitioners. It does mean that these performative artist scholars take great pains to make sure that the value of the written word is not more than that of the practice itself. I hope that helps?

DANCE

Yes, that does help, thank you.

ALLISON

Drama, could you tell us a little more about your background in research?

DRAMA

Why certainly, Allison! Leavy (2014) marked a point of separation between arts-based methods such as poetry and drama. For the sake of length, I choose to refer mainly to these general terms: poetry, drama, and performative writing. Poetry (and by relation spoken word), Leavy stated that is generally used as a representational form, while Faulkner (2005) suggested using poetic form when seeking an emotional response and doesn't limit that to just representation. As with any research method, no one works for every situation. It is up to the researcher to find the one that fits best (Faulkner, 2005). As an art form, I take many shapes, and each of these speaks more specifically to a particular type of research puzzle. Of all the performative art forms, no disrespect to my other esteemed panelists here tonight, I am the most easily accepted and understood because of my textual foundation in script-writing.

Using me in research fosters a critical sense of agency and empowerment for marginalized voices (Mykitiuk, 2015). I am a clearly related part of the narrative family, and like the best stories, I can be multilayered (Aaltonen & Bruun, 2014) and multivoiced. Researchers use a variety of theatrical techniques to maintain a strong connection to the research process, and data is considered a type of ethnodrama (Saldana, 2003, 2005).

ALLISON

Music, I don't want you to feel left out.

MUSIC

Like Dance, I am fluid. That fluidity can be considered just another reflection of the lived experiences that qualitative and performative researchers attempt to capture. There is fluidity in culture, in observations, and interviews (Given, 2008). In keeping with that idea of fluidity, I will utilize the words *music* and *sound* interchangeably while acknowledging that there are some inherent differences in how humans distinguish between those two words that in another setting would need to be explored further. My inclusion as part of a research study requires the researchers, professional or layman, to cultivate their sensitivity to the role of the auditory in our lives.

Western research methodologies are primarily concerned with textual and visual understandings (Bresler, 2005; Pink, 2015). Unless you have a hearing impairment of some type, however, living is not a silent endeavor. Sound surrounds us and organized sound becomes music to our ears and offers us another way of knowing. The presence, or absence, of sound tells us many things. An interesting note that is peculiar to music researchers is how interviewers search for rooms with great acoustics. Only small leakages of sounds from outside the room where participants tell their stories are acceptable (Hall, Brett, & Coffey, 2008).

Sound is always a part of our research process. Even when it is not the direct means of inquiry, process, or dissemination, the music in the sounds of our life are present. In every interview or focus group, there are the nervous whispers between participants as recorders are set up, the soft whirring of a videotape as it rewinds, and the frantic shuffling through papers and bags looking for extra batteries. There is the soft scratch scratch scratch of the pen across paper; auditory details that could enrich our narrative accounts and serve to draw the reader into the lived experience. The same attention to the auditory can be an additional layer that brings participants' stories alive in ways that simply describing the visuals around them do not.

ALLISON

Wow Music, I never considered some of your points. I wonder how the sound of children's laughter would personalize educational research, and how could it affect the reflective process of educational researchers? Would we perhaps bear in mind the true beneficiaries of educational research if scholars could share auditory data with their readers? It stands to reason in my mind that inclusion of this smallest of details can provide a rich sensory engagement that offers benefits to all: participants, researchers, and readers. Thank you for opening my eyes.

VISUAL ARTS

I guess that leaves me for last. I don't really like to speak about myself that much. I'll just say that in the *Handbook of the Arts in Qualitative Research*, Weber listed ten reasons why the use of visual images (Weber, 2008) in research can be a powerful tool for reaching your audience.

Images can

- capture things that are difficult to put into words;
- make us pay attention in new ways;
- are memorable;
- can provide layered and nuanced understanding;
- enhance empathy;
- offer metaphor and simile to explain theoretical concepts.
- encourage embodied knowledge;
- be more accessible;
- facilitate reflexivity;
- provoke action for social justice. (p. 44)

However, please consider the processes through which these visual images are created and/or used, not just the resulting images, but as methods that inform our knowledge. For example, the process of taking the pictures is equally as important as the pictures themselves (Chung et al., 2006). The same holds true for the process of video-making (Chavez et al., 2004), painting and drawing (Yonas et al., 2009) as well as the resulting artistic product in each.

ALLISON

What an amazing panel of guests! Thank you again for taking time from your busy schedules to be here. Visual Arts, could I get you to share some examples of how you've been used in research practices?

VISUAL ARTS

Why yes, of course. In *Talking Wellness* (Chung et al., 2006), arts-based and community-based participatory research methods were combined. Community partners decided that the arts would be a non-threatening vehicle for initiating a dialogue about general wellness and ways to decrease the stigma around the naming of depression in the African American community. Three of the four chosen activities revolved around images: a film screening, a photo exhibit, and screening of a new public service announcement (PSA).

In this case the participant research revolved around artistic forms, but did not require the actual participants to create individual expressions of art. The film centered artistic responses to *The Middle Passage* of the African slave trade. The community partners hoped to use the images and sounds of beauty created by the artists in the film as a witness and an acknowledgement of the community's collective sorrow. They also hoped that by following the screening with a group discussion, led by knowledgeable facilitators, that they could lay a foundation for the complexities rooted in depression for African Americans.

The second activity, a photo exhibit, used photos taken in various locations throughout the community to convey how environmental factors can impact mood both positively (community landmarks) and negatively (abandoned homes). Lastly, the PSA developed by a national organization used African American actors to speak about depression and its impact on

family and employment. In this project, the arts were used to solicit responses from the community; however, they did not gather specific data relating to the use of the arts themselves.

I almost forgot about Chavez et al. (2004). The making of a community video was used to build bridges between various communities.

Stakeholders from these various communities were involved in all aspects of the decision making process, the scriptwriting, filming, and editing process. The process of making the video facilitated discussion among different community partners, and the overall process became more important than the resulting documentary as a testament to the building of community bridges.

ALLISON

These sound very interesting to me because I am African American, and I am personally aware of difficulties involved with facilitating discussions around certain wellness issues in my community. Plus, the building of community is also something that I hold dear to my heart. I must tell you though that this is the one artistic arena in which I find myself loudly silent. I have no intimate knowledge or connection to the visual arts. I approach any visual activity as I would the monster under my bed, with a healthy dose of trepidation. (*recorded laughter*). It is one area of arts-based practice in which my knowledge is not an embodied experience, but remains an academic exercise.

VISUAL ARTS

Oh no Allison! I'm so sorry you feel this way.

ALLISON

I can follow instructions, but it never moves past that into the truly creative. I think that is why I continue to shy away from working in this area. That lack of creative facility and ownership makes me uncomfortable. Like all embodied knowledge though, that lack is its own story. My very real fear of blank spaces on paper says something about who I am as a person, and as an arts-based researcher. Perhaps I should try again to explore that fear through a visual means. That is, after all, what I advocate for others who say they fear the stage or performing: try it. Try it again. There's nothing scary about the black stage floor, the huge black curtain legs hanging down to block the audience's view of the performers as they wait to enter. That's definitely something to think about for future investigation. Dance, in my research practice, I often ask how my research practices differ when the researcher, artist, and participants are not embodied in the same person. Do you have any experiences that might speak to that?

DANCE

Allison, one of my favorite studies speaks to that interestingly enough. In goals, approaches, and disciplines practice based researchers investigating through dance and movement can be miles apart (Chin, Sakamoto, & Bleuer, 2014). In one study, Boydell, Gladstone, and Volpe (2008)

interviewed sixty youth experiencing psychotic breaks for the first time. Dance was not a part of this original study, rather it was a separate and distinct partnership specifically entered into as a way of disseminating the study results to a wider audience (Boydell, 2011). The researchers in this partnership expressed frustration with the limited textual and academic ways of sharing information. Partnering with artists was an attempt to reach stakeholders (parents, patients, service providers, etc.) that would not have access to academic journal articles, yet needed access to the information in order to improve the quality of their lives and the lives of those they serve (Boydell, 2011).

The original study looked at various pathways taken by youth to mental health care. The interviews revealed youthful ignorance about symptoms indicating psychotic distress, societal and familial stigma attached to a formal diagnosis, and even difficulty with recognizing signs of distress among professional mental health workers. The secondary study involved using this data as a basis for the researcher-artist partnership. The primary foundation for this secondary effort was funding for “knowledge translation” (p. 13) efforts. The efforts describe were fraught with tensions between acceptable sacrifices between disciplines, between the truth of the research and the truth of the artistic insight, between systematic and organic methods of inquiry, and between embodied knowing and objective observation (Boydell, 2011). These tensions are

not unique to this study, rather it is a commonality in all arts-based projects (Lafreniere, Cox, Belliveau, & Graham, 2012; Saldana, 2008; White & Belliveau, 2010).

The performance that resulted from this partnership was shared with a variety of stakeholders, most of whom would never read an academic journal. Audiences were encouraged to engage with the work through post-performance *Talk Backs* (*conversations between audience and cast members after a performance*), researcher notes, and even post it notes left by attendees. It was noted that the use of the art form as a representation of the findings facilitated the sharing of the emotional and contextual findings that are often lost in traditional academic dissemination.

ALLISON

That is very interesting. Since I enter the research process as both researcher and artist, I have never considered the struggle for balance from this perspective. I do grapple with finding a balance between my research and artistic truths in the inquiry, representation, and dissemination process. I can't imagine the struggle to reconcile those differences between separate individuals! I believe that the corporeal way of knowing, and use of self as the starting place for any type of understanding makes the data personal in ways that telling the stories of others will never be. By compartmentalizing our thoughts from our movements, we (academics) have cut ourselves off from truly recognizing and integrating the depth of our knowledge and how it interacts with our work.

MUSIC

Dance, that sounds really interesting. Two of my favorite experiences have been when researchers have used me as an elicitation device.

Auditory elicitation was used by Snyder (1993) to explore personal meaning attached to music associated with sporting events. Participants listened to two-minute musical segments of songs traditionally associated with a variety of American sporting events. Throughout this process, participants documented their feelings and memories associated with the selections.

In Allett's dissertation research, music was used as an elicitation device with a small group of Extreme Metal music fans (Allett, 2010). Members of the group were asked to share a loved music track and why they enjoyed it. Allett found that using music in this way provided a link between emotions and situations, provided reference points for group discussions, and drew out more descriptive accounts related to the sounds. The article's summary places the focal point toward learning more about the role of music in the lives of participants. It also mentions that this technique could also be used to "trigger personal, collective, and historical memory" (p. 4).

ALLISON

The idea of using music as a "trigger" for memories and historical accounting rings true in my experiences with my mother. We often sing songs together as we travel, and afterwards she is more likely to share

stories of growing up and other places, or people that she associates with those songs. I've been informally gathering and archiving her remembrances for later. I never connected the two before now, but I have noticed that she shares more from her long-term memory when we sing than when I initiate a conversation without a musical prompt.

VISUAL ARTS Allison, have you heard of Photovoice?

ALLISON No. Is that a type of research method?

VISUAL ARTS Yes. I was thinking about it as a way of working past your apprehension of visual arts processes. Photovoice is a common visual art process for qualitative research. In this method, cameras are given to those with the least power in the research dialogue, the participants. The participants take pictures in response to the researcher's questions and open a dialogue between themselves and the researchers (Wang, 1999; Wang & Pies, 2008) so that the balance of power is more equally distributed through including images they've taken in discussion. It allows community members to creatively express their needs without adhering to the boundaries of the written word through which researchers may hold a certain advantage (Rieger & Schultz, 2014).

As part of an international human rights project, Photovoice was combined with narrative inquiry and used in a study of gender inequality experienced by South African girls (Simmonds, 2015). After the girls were trained on the use of the cameras, they were given a prompt and for ten days took photos that reflected their understanding. Here is the prompt researchers provided:

Take photographs of landscapes/objects/people/situations/symbols anywhere in your school and home environment to express what you perceive and experience as gender equity. (p. 38)

The photos were developed and each girl went through three reflective conversations about the experience. First, they met in an individual interview with the researchers to tell the narrative of the photo. Second, they reflected on the experiences around the taking of the photos. Last, they shared their photos, narratives, and reflections with each other in a focus group session. While the researchers found the process to be a powerful tool in the hands of the girls, they do suggest that clarity of purpose and design are required so as not to dilute the understandings observed.

This really might be a way for you to lessen your discomfort with a visual art practice since the actual art creation is done by the participants.

ALLISON

I think that is a wonderful idea. I look forward to trying that out at some point. Thank you for the suggestion.

DRAMA

(laughter) It is funny that you bring that process up Visual Arts. Aarseth's (2012) thesis research was co-authored with secondary school participants. The drama was based on their lives and work in identity construction through arts-based practices. The final product was a mixed-media production. Students used photos as a facilitation method for dramatic writing and choreography. Of course, the final production focused more on the truth revealed in the participants work than adherence to any performance aesthetic (Aaltonen & Bruun, 2014).

VISUAL ARTS

Really, Drama? That sounds really interesting. I love it when we can work together. Oh! You reminded me of another study that used photo elicitation. (I think the difference in terminology is simply a disciplinary difference.) Anyway, photo elicitation (Hatten, Forin, & Adams, 2013) relies on images to initiate dialogue similarly to Photovoice. In photo elicitation, the images are usually supplied by the researcher as part of the interview process, and discussed through guided questioning (Collier, 1957; Collier & Collier, 1986). According to Hatten et al. (2013), photo elicitation can be effective because the portion of our brains responding to images is much older than the portion that is connected to verbal response. They claim it is instinctive and can foster a more authentic engagement with ideas and concepts. Sometimes this method is expanded to include asking participants to create their own images. Researchers in physical education pedagogy (Azzarito, Simon, & Marttinen, 2016) used what they

called “visual participatory methodology” (p. 57) as they queried secondary students’ view of their bodies in relation to the media. Data was collected from multiple sources which included visual diaries and photo elicitation. A specialized curriculum was created along with critical discussions about the role of media in body image ideals.

They found that participants had a firm understanding of the negative way in which the media can influence body perceptions, but they still personally held to an ideal body type that was presented through the media even as they stood strongly against the power of media-formed imaging. Researchers concluded that the inclusion of visual inquiry methods was a powerful force in helping young people critically strengthen their views in this area.

DRAMA

That is so cool. I did enjoy combining the various artistic disciplines, but I have to admit though that one of my favorite practices is found poetry. Found poetry restricts the researcher to the participant’s words when creating a poetic reflection of a specific phenomenon (Lafreniere et al., 2012). Let me give you a few examples of how this process works. The Tree of Hope project in Tasmania, Australia utilized poetry writing as one of three arts based ways of soliciting young people’s thoughts on hope and happiness (Bishop & Willis, 2014). Asking youth to choose from a variety of poetic styles and alternatives presented, they created a poetic text reflecting the role of hope in their lives.

Consciously or unconsciously aligning with Leavy and Faulkner, the researchers chose poetry as both a representational form and a means of eliciting a deeper emotional response. They also employed a less recognized method – poetic inquiry. In this process, participants write a poetic response to a research question, and that response is then analyzed through the coding of text for the creation of themes. They justify their use of poetry as a fulfillment of “qualitative social science research: to create holistic insights into people’s subjective experiences and perceptions” (Bishop & Willis, 2014, para. 38).

Lafreniere, Cox, Belliveau, and Graham (2012) studied the experiences of volunteers in health research. A striking difference between this project and the one mentioned above is that the researchers themselves created the art work even though they were not artists. They solicited assistance from artists, both lay and professional, in creating/performing/displaying art works in various forms, combining drama, found poetry, song, and visual art in a research performance.

There were three groups involved in the process: 1) undergraduates enrolled in a poetry writing class and professors interested in ethics, 2) social scientists, graduate students, and philosophers, and 3) graduate students, with varying backgrounds, enrolled in a qualitative research methods class. They were given transcripts centered around findings from

a previous study, an explanation of the themes in the findings, and a basic set of rules regarding the found poetry process. The creation of a dramatic “re(presentation)” (p. 249) was based on coded interview transcripts, and then performed for a live audience.

Look! Another way researchers integrate art forms within their practices!

DANCE

Personally, I am drawn to research that reaches out to the community, or builds on cultural ties. It could be understood that work in arts-based interventions is another form of practice as research. Researchers working with Hawaiian native populations co-designed a qualitative project utilizing cultural affinity to the hula dance to facilitate such an intervention in cardiac rehabilitation. Extensive consultations with the ka po-e hula - the hula community, the kupuna loea hula – the hula elders, and halau hula – the hula schools respectively (Look, Kaholokula, Carvalho, Seto, & de Silva, 2012) ensured that cultural norms and traditions were honored.

After initial hospitalization, patients in this study participated in hula classes three times a week for one hour. Classes were held on hospital grounds for expediency’s sake in case of the need for emergency personnel. The nature of hula allowed movements to be adapted to the ability of each participant without losing cultural significance and physical benefit. The group provided social and emotional support as participants

struggled to make changes to improve their lifestyles (Look et al., 2012). By choosing hula as the method through which they would deliver this intervention, researchers were able to strengthen and build on cultural ties with the community, engage participants through respectful treatment of their traditions, and encourage the voices of the community to be heard as equals (Look et al., 2012). Boydell (2011) on the other hand was further engaged in knowing through dance as the dance artists created their own analysis of the data in order to create their movements. She documents her shock and unawareness that “both art-based research and science involve the use of systematic experimentation with the goal of gaining knowledge about life” (McNiff, 1998a, p. 33).

ALLISON

I am always interested in research that involves children in some way. I think that comes from my years as a teaching artist in the K-12 system.

MUSIC

There are a few studies that come to mind involving me, and children. Australian researchers (Sonn, Grossman, & Utomo, 2013) sought information on the role of arts education in social acculturation/transculturation, fostering of wellbeing, and language learning through participants’ involvement with The Song Room (TSR). Refugee children were involved in multiple art forms including music over the course of six months.

In this case, the music lessons themselves were used as an elicitation tool from which researchers could gather information on the young refugee experience. Since it was a mixed arts project, the findings were not always specifically connected with music. The major theme in the project was an increased sense of belonging within the school culture, and seemed to be felt by participants regardless of the art form used.

Music has also been used as a way of disseminating findings such as through the music videos created by the Stilettos to Moccasins project. A music video was produced as part of a drug addiction study with a goal of knowledge translation to a wide audience with varying degrees of formal education (Hall, Brett, & Coffey, 2008).

I almost forgot! Another study that I really enjoyed combined community-based participatory research (CBPR) and music, Petrucka et al. (2014) worked with street involved youth (their terminology) to provide voice to their experience, lifestyle, needs, etc. from their perspective. They chose music as a method that would be of interest to young people and a way of building community between the researchers and participants. Participants created lyrics, music, and video in the rap genre often independently of the researchers. This use of music as the method of inquiry fostered a sense of empowerment for the youthful participants, and because rap is a storytelling device (Love, 2014), it

allowed the participants a chance to tell their stories in their voices which was an important goal of the research project.

VISUAL ARTS

In *Visual Voices* (Yonas et al., 2009), young people were given 3'x5' pieces of brown craft paper, and asked to paint in response to questions about where they felt safe/unsafe in their neighborhoods. A limited number of brushes and water were provided to encourage sharing between youth. After finishing the initial paintings, they collectively reflected and discussed each painting by providing critique and praise. The next step included drawing and writing in similar fashion to the painting process, and lastly they did the same with photographs. The youth then worked with the researchers to curate a display of their work in a way that gave visual voice to their thoughts.

ALLISON

As I set out on this journey to become an arts-based researcher, I early on decided that I wanted to know how everything worked. I wanted to understand how the practice of each art form could provide, withhold, cloud, or clarify what I understood. As a trained opera singer, I consider myself an interdisciplinary artist. I sing stories, layered narratives of music, drama, and movement through time and space in order to initiate an emotional dialogue with the audience. Having the opportunity to speak with each of you is making me reconsider the possibilities of what I can accomplish through you.

I just completed a case study with twenty preservice teachers (PSTs). I wanted to understand how dance/movement could be used as an instructional strategy in PST training programs. I didn't focus on a particular subgenre of dance so much as I worked through interpretive movements. I think the most difficult part was actually trying to recreate movement through text.

DANCE

Oh my goodness, yes. That has to be one of the most difficult thing for any artist.

DRAMA

Some scholars have found a way to deal with that though. *Performative writing* can help fill that void, even though that is not its primary focus. Performative writing is not usually included within a discussion of arts-based methods, yet through the process of writing performatively, we practice it as method. In fact, the goals of dramatic inquiry and process in research are almost interchangeable with those of performative writing. Pollock (1998) suggested that performative writing is identifiable through six traits: *evocative, metonymic, subjective, nervous, citational, and consequential*. First, it should evoke recognition of the world around us and perspectives of the world that are not our own. It is a sensory invitation to move beyond what we think we know by crisscrossing boundaries of creative and critical process. It is metonymic as the process of writing becomes the performance of the text for both author and reader.

It is an act of layering meaning through content and dissemination. Subjectivity in this case is a shared articulation of author's place, and the reader enters clearly understanding the relationship and perspective provided. It gives the reader an informed entry into the work that is not always a given. The immersion into the unexpected and the often unexplored brings forth nervousness in both the reader and the writer. Performative writing redefines disciplinary boundaries and challenges traditional understandings through the pull of sensory invitation. A summation of performative writing as citational can be found in Ecclesiastes 1:9 (King James Version), "...and there is no new thing under the sun." It reworks and revises that which we already know to bring to life a new perspective of the old. Finally, performative writing is consequential. It gathers new audiences and interacts with traditional audiences in ways that are new to them (Pollock, 1998).

ALLISON

I try to write performatively, even though I do not always specify the components listed by Pollock. I think my approach is more pragmatic. Like Pelias (2004) and Carver (2007), I write to connect to others whether that means an actual script, or just the one in my head. I write to share the performance of myself as artist/scholar/poor/Black/southern and often tired. I write to share my performance of all those simultaneous identities with and for my readers and dare them to balance the weight for themselves. Performative writing is fluid and now. It shares life inside

the practice that is the research. It asks its own questions of the researcher, and requires answers apart from the practice. It is doing, not describing (Pollock, 1998). My writing is living performance captured for those who will never hear or see me perform (Upshaw, 2016).

DRAMA

Researchers have also used scripts to reveal how Alzheimer's patients continue, even in their diminished capacities, to struggle toward personhood (Kontos, 2007). Cancer was personified as an active, onstage character in *The Work of Talk* (Paget, 1993). In the play, the disease interacted with the patient, sometimes dressing her, sometimes putting on her makeup...clearly a metaphor for the all-consuming role of cancer in the patient's life. In this case, dramatization was used to evoke an empathetic involvement from the audience.

(wrap up sign from director)

ALLISON

I can't believe that time has flown by so quickly. Music, Drama, Visual Arts, Dance, thank you so much for taking the time to share the way you have been used in artistic research practices. I have truly enjoyed the time we've spent together. I feel as if I know more of your secrets now.

(entire cast laughs)

ALLISON

As an arts-based researcher, I feel a strong responsibility to tell participant stories correctly, or maybe a better phrase would be to tell them sincerely. I also feel a commitment to interact with the art form at the highest level of professionalism that I can attain. For me, that is different from the commitment to the participants' stories and from my commitment to the quality of my work as a researcher. It is a drive for respect as an artist, and probably has a lot to do with the way artists are treated outside of academia.

**DANCE/DRAMA/
VISUAL
ARTS/MUSIC**

Thank you Allison./How beautiful./Thank you./Thank you.

ALLISON

I am aware of how difficult it can be for others to take our work as artist-scholars seriously because many have only experienced the arts as entertainment. A good artist is a great magician. We work very hard to keep the nuts and bolts from showing. Our artistry should look effortless. When I share my work as an artist-scholar, it is personal in many ways and on many levels. Each project, each conference presentation, each article is part of my fight to be taken seriously as an artist and a scholar simultaneously.

I am not one without the other now and my work must be evaluated from that standpoint. I have never heard a researcher talk about a strong commitment to the writing process outside of it being a vehicle for the research information. Do other researchers train to become better writers so that their conveyance of information from non-traditional research forms can be evaluated appropriately? Do they see themselves as writers with a commitment to being the best writer they can be, outside of their lives as researchers? I do not know, but suspect that this burden of proof is not something many non artist-scholars feel as a responsibility. That, dear viewers, seems like a topic to pursue on another show. Tonight I thank my guests and say until next time.

References

- Aaltonen, H. B., & Bruun, F. (2014). Practice as research in drama and theatre: Introducing narrative supervision methodology. *InFormation - Nordic Journal of Art and Research*, 3(1), 52-68.
- Aarseth, I. (2012) *Kroppen på spill: en undersøkelse av hvordan ungdomsskoleelever skaper sin identitet gjennom fysisk teater og fotografi* [Body in play: A study about how pupils at secondary school create their identity by physical theatre and photography] (Unpublished master's dissertation). Trondheim: NTNU.
- Allett, N. (2010). *Sounding out: Using music elicitation in qualitative research*. Manchester, UK: ESRC National Centre for Research Methods.
- Azzarito, L., Simon, M., & Martinen, R. (2016). "Stop photo-shopping!" A visual participatory inquiry into students' responses to a body curriculum. *Journal of Teaching in Physical Education*, 35, 54-69.
- Bagley, C., & Cancienne, M. B. (2002). *Dancing the data*. Frankfurt, Germany: Peter Lang.
- Bishop, E., & Willis, K. (2014). "Hope is that fiery feeling": Using poetry as data to explore the meanings of hope for young people. *Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, 15 (1). Retrieved from <http://www.qualitative-research.net/index.php/fqs/article/view/2013/3631>
- Boydell, K. (2011). Making sense of collective events: The co-creation of a research-based dance. *Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, 12(1). Retrieved from <http://www.qualitative-research.net/index.php/fqs/article/view/1525/3143>
- Boydell, K., Gladstone, B., & Volpe, T. (2008). Understanding help-seeking delay in first psychosis prodrome. A secondary analysis of the perspectives of young people. *Schizophrenia Research*, 83 (S124).
- Bresler, L. (2005). What musicianship can teach educational research. *Music Education Research*, 7 (2), 169-183.
- Carver, M. (2007). Methodology of the heart: A performative writing response. *Liminalities: A Journal of Performance Studies*, 3 (1), 1-14.
- Chavez, V., Israel, B., Allen III, A., DeCarlo, M., Lichtenstein, R., Schulz, A., et al. (2004). A bridge between communities: Video-making using principles of community-based participatory research. *Health Promotion Practice*, 5 (4), 395-403.
- Chin, M., Sakamoto, I., & Bleuer, J. (2014). The dynamics of show and tell: Arts-based methods and language ideologies in community-based research. *Journal of Community Practice*, 22, 256-273.

- Chung, B., Corbett, C., Boulet, B., Cummings, J., Paxton, K., McDaniel, S., et al. (2006). Talking wellness: A description of a community-academic partnered project to engage an African-American community around depression through the use of poetry, film, and photography. *Ethnicity & Disease, 16* (Winter).
- Clandinin, D. & Connelly, F. (2004). *Narrative inquiry: experience and story in qualitative research*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Collier, J. (1957). Photography in anthropology: A report on two experiments. *American Anthropologist, 59*(5), 843–859.
- Collier, J., & Collier, M. (1986). *Visual anthropology: photography as a research method*. Albuquerque, NM: University of New Mexico Press.
- Crenshaw, K. (1989). Demarginalizing the intersection of race and sex: A black feminist critique of antidiscrimination doctrine, feminist theory, and antiracist politics. *University of Chicago Legal Forum, (1), 8*, 139-167. Retrieved from <http://chicagounbound.uchicago.edu/uclf/vol1989/iss1/8>
- Denzin, N. (2003). *Performance ethnography: Critical pedagogy and the politics of culture*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Descartes, R., Cottingham, J., Stoothoff, R., & Murdoch, D. (1984). *The philosophical writings of Descartes* (Vol. II). UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Faulkner, S. (2005). *How do you know a good poem: Poetic representation and the case for criteria*. Symposium conducted at the First International Conferences on Qualitative Inquiry. Champaign, IL: Urban-Champaign.
- Given, L. (Ed.). (2008). *The Sage encyclopedia of qualitative research methods* (Vol. 1). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Hall, T., Brett, L., & Coffey, A. (2008). Sound and the everyday in qualitative research. *Qualitative Inquiry, 14*(6), 1019-1040.
- Haseman, B. (2006). A manifesto for performative research. *Media International Australia incorporating Culture and Policy: Practice-led research, 118*, 98-106.
- Hatten, K., Forin, T. R., & Adams, R. (2013). *A picture elicits a thousand meanings: Photo elicitation as a method for investigating cross-disciplinary identity development*. In ASEE Annual Conference and Exposition, Conference Proceedings.
- Kontos, P. &. (2007). 'Expressions of personhood in Alzheimer's disease': An evaluation of research-based theatre as a pedagogical tool. *Qualitative Health Research, 17*(6), 799–811.

- Lafreniere, D., Cox, S., Belliveau, G., & Graham, L. (2012). Performing the human subject: Arts-based knowledge dissemination in health research. *Journal of Applied Arts & Health*, 3 (3).
- Leavy, P. (2014). *Method meets art: Arts based research practice*. New York, NY: The Guilford Press.
- Little, S. (2011). Practice and performance as research in the arts. In D. Bendrups, & G. Downes (Eds.), *Dunedin soundings: Place and performance* (pp. 17-26). New Zealand: Otago University Press.
- Look, M., Kaholokula, J., Carvalho, A., Seto, T., & de Silva, M. (2012). Developing a culturally based cardiac rehabilitation program: The HELA study. *Progress in Community Health Partnerships: Research, Education, and Action*, 6 (1), 103-110.
- Love, B. (2014). Urban storytelling: How storyboarding, moviemaking, and hip-hop based education can promote students' critical voice. *English Journal*, 103(5), 53-58.
- Markula, P. (2006). Dance as performative qualitative research. *Journal of Sport & Social Issues*, 30(4), 353-363.
- Mason, J. (2002). *Qualitative researching*. London, UK: Sage.
- Mykitiuk, R. C. (2015). Beyond normative ethics: Ethics of arts-based disability research. *Ethics, Medicine, and Public Health*, 1(3), 373-382.
- Paget, M. (1993). In M. DeVault (Ed.), *A complex sorrow: Reflections on cancer and an abbreviated life*. Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press.
- Pelias, R. (2004). *A methodology of the heart: evoking academic and daily life*. Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press.
- Petrucka, P. B. et al. (2014). At street level: Learnings, voices, experiences, and lifestyles of street involved youth. *Nursing and Health*, 2(2), 48-56.
- Pink, S. (2015). *Doing sensory ethnography*. (2nd Ed.) London, UK: Sage.
- Pollock, D. (1998). Performing writing. In P. Phelan (Ed.), *The Ends of Performance* (pp. 73-103). New York, NY: New York University Press.
- Rieger, K., & Schultz, A.S. (2014). Exploring arts-based knowledge translation: sharing research findings through performing the patterns, rehearsing the results, staging the synthesis. *Worldviews Evidence Based Nursing*, 11(2), 133-39.
- Saldana, J. (2008). Second chair: An autoethnodrama. *Research Studies in Music Education*, 30(2), 177-191.

- Saldana, J. (Ed.). (2005). *Ethnodrama: An anthology of reality theatre*. Walnut Creek, CA: Alta Mira Press.
- Saldana, J. (2003). Dramatizing data: A primer. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 9(2), 218-236.
- Simmonds, S. R. (2015). Blurring the boundaries between photovoice and narrative inquiry: Photovoice methodology for gender-based research. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 14(3), 33-49.
- Sklar, D. (1991). On dance ethnography. *Dance Research Journal*, 23(1), 6-10.
- Snowber, C. (2012). Dance as a way of knowing. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 134(Summer), 53-60.
- Snyder, E. (1993). Responses to musical selections and sport: An auditory elicitation approach. *Sociology of Sport Journal*, 10, 168-182.
- Sonn, C., Grossman, M., & Utomo, A. (2013). Reflections on a participatory research project: Young people of refugee background in an arts-based program. *Journal for Social Action in Counseling and Psychology*, 5(3), 95-110.
- Spry, T. (2001). Performing autoethnography: an embodied methodological praxis. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 7 (6), 706-732.
- Upshaw, A. (2016). Arias to academia: An academic malpractice suite in three movements. *The Qualitative Research Journal* 16(3), 263-273.
- Wang, C. (1999). Photovoice: A participatory action research strategy applied to women's health. *Journal of Women's Health*, 8, 185-192.
- Wang, C. C., & Pies, C. A. (2008). Using photovoice for participatory assessment and issue selection: Lessons from a family, maternal, and child health department. In M. Minkler & N. Wallerstein (Eds.), *Community-based participatory research for health: From process to outcomes* (pp.183-197). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Weber, S. (2008). Visual images in research. In J. G. Knowles (Ed.), *Handbook of the arts in qualitative research. [electronic resource: Perspectives, methodologies, examples, and issues]*. Los Angeles, CA: Sage.
- Welsh-Asante, K. (1997). *African dance: An artistic, historical and philosophical inquiry*. Trenton, NJ: Africa World Press.
- White, V., & Belliveau, G. (2010). Whose story is it anyway? Exploring ethical dilemmas in performed research. *Performing Ethos International Research Journal*, 1(1), 85-95.
- Yonas, M., Burke, J., Rak, K., Bennett, A., Kelly, V., & Gielen, A. (2009). A picture's worth a thousand words: Engaging youth in cbpr using the creative arts. *Progress in Community Health Partnerships: Research, Education, and Action*, 3(4), 349-358.

WHO REALLY KILLED COCK ROBIN:

AESTHETIC MEANING-MAKING IN PRESERVICE TEACHER TRAINING

Reconstructed/Collapsed Memory

It is a deceptively clear beautiful day. The wind has a strong bite to it. It is January, and even the American South gets cold sometimes. I sip on a small coffee from McDonald's as I walk quickly into the elementary school ahead. Thank goodness, I parked close to the front door. I ring the doorbell and try to make sure they can see my face in the little camera beside the door. Rushing in, I breathe a sigh of relief as the heat hits me in the face. I don't know the greeter's name, but she's here all the time. I smile and exchange brief pleasantries as I sign in using the computer by the principal's office.

She buzzes me through the next set of doors, and I smile at the children's artwork displayed in the atrium. It's always exciting when there is a visible commitment to the arts. Winding through the empty hallways to my left, I pass by the cafeteria and head down to the classroom where the preservice teachers have their class with Dr. Wagoner. I catch her eye as I try to quietly enter and set my bag down. She indicates that she will be through shortly. I continue to drink my coffee as I wait. I shouldn't be nervous, but I am. Lost in my thoughts, I almost miss her brief introduction of me to the class.

Taking a deep breath, I paste on a big smile and practically bounce to the front of the room. I have done this for four semesters, but this is different. This time I am actually collecting data. Facing the fifteen or so preservice teachers in this class, I begin to sing the chorus from a song by Sweet Honey in the Rock (2007).

*I clap my hands
I stomp my feet
And I groove when I move
Cause the rhythm's in me
I shake my shoulders
Move'em all around
Then I move my hips from left to right
And boogie on down
It's plain to see
It's fun to be me
And I like it like that*

Everybody stand up. (Shaking my head internally, I wonder if I was ever this young and insecure. I watch as they tentatively stand and nervously look at each other for confirmation that

this is not weird, and no one's going to laugh at them.) *I am going to sing that again, and this time I want you to repeat each phrase after me. Feel free to move around...*

Have a seat. My name is Allison Upshaw, and I am one of Dr. Wagoner's graduate students. This semester I will teach you an arts integrated lesson, and you will have the opportunity to implement that same lesson with a group of fifth graders. There are weekly journal prompts to respond to as well. We will begin in two weeks. Today I am here to request permission to use your journal entries as well as my classroom observations as part of my dissertation research. How can the integration of the arts be used as instructional strategies for preservice teachers is one of the questions that I'm trying to answer. I need your assistance in helping figure out the best way to do that.

For the past twenty years or so, I've worked as a teaching artist throughout the southeastern United States. I teach kids and teachers how to use the arts to improve student learning and comprehension of non-arts subjects...like using music to teach math or drama to teach social studies. My research revolves around pre-service teachers, that would be you, and their interaction with arts integration. That's what we'll be working on together. If there are no questions for me, I'll leave the permission requests with you. Dr. Wagoner will collect them, and we'll start in two weeks. Walking to the back of the room, making eye contact with a few of the students as I go, I gather my things and quietly head out of the door as Dr. Wagoner begins collecting the papers.

The Study

One of the expectations of good scientific research is the ability to replicate the project (Peng, 2009). However, replication was not the focus of this particular research design. I wanted to understand how dance could be used as an instructional strategy, but I also wanted to understand the story behind the potential results and how this would impact my own teaching practices.

That need to provide context for the results led me to understand that certain tenets from case study (Hancock & Algozzine, 2011; Stake, 1995; Yin, 2003) would be an integral part of the practice design. This study focused on a particular activity, arts integration instruction with preservice teachers, within the natural context of an ongoing children's literature class. It was bounded by space and time in a 2-hour and 45-minute class that met once a week (Hancock &

Algozzine, 2011). Use of these tenets encouraged an exploitation of rich, sensory descriptions from various sources of data.

It simulated participatory action research (Walker, 1993; McTaggart, 1991) as method through the active inclusion of my participants as data collectors. Participatory action research also involves a cycle of critical self-reflection embodied by the researcher. Most important for my work is the expectation in participatory action research that findings will affect change in both my research and my practice resulting in active change.

Finally, from narrative research, I borrowed ideas of co-constructed and multi-layered experiences (Andrews, Squire, & Tamboukou, 2013; Riessman, 2008). Class conversations and my personal responses to the participants' entries co-constructed the narrative of how dance as an instructional strategy would benefit them in the classroom. My entry into this process was interdisciplinary evidenced in part by the multiplicity of my roles: student, researcher, and teaching artist. The intersections of the participants' narratives and mine in the roles above provided a multi-layered perspective.

Data collection and analysis. Twenty female participants were solicited from a course on children's literature. The only prerequisite for participation was that they be a part of this class. The informed consent did not ask for specific demographic information. From purely visual observations and personal conversations, the participants self-identified as white females in their early twenties. There were no visible disabilities present. The participants were considered a cohort by the College of Education and took all their classes together. Therefore, they were not strangers to each other.

They all volunteered permission for me to gather data from their journals and my classroom observations. Qualitative field notes and video recordings were also used in data

collection; however, in this article I center information from the journal entries as a way of privileging the participants' metacognitive processing. Since the study focused on the participation of the adult preservice teachers, there were no video or journal data collected from the elementary students. I did audio-record participant use of the instructional strategy in the classrooms with digital recorders and iPhones.

My overall approach to analysis began with adapted qualitative coding methods detailed in Saldaña (2013) as part of a first and second cycle of coding. Eclectic coding (p. 262) covered a combination of large group or first cycle coding methods followed by a more detailed process. Under the umbrella of an eclectic coding process, I began my analytic process by using exploratory and holistic coding (p. 263-264) as my first cycle of data organization. Exploratory coding is just that. As a new researcher, and unsure of what I was looking for exactly, I separated the data by participant and researcher input then by journal entries, field memos, audio/video recordings, classroom observations, meetings, and emails. I found the richest data related to the participants in their journal entries, classroom observations, and field memos, and began a more in-depth analysis focused in those areas.

Holistic coding allows one code to be used for a large body of data. After separating the data into the categories above and selecting the areas that I felt held the richest sources of information, I used holistic coding as a first cycle – part B. One of the first layers of analysis in part B was headed *PST questions*. They were labeled as such no matter the question topic even if they were found in different spaces such as PST journals, classroom observations, and field memos. During this first part of the coding cycle, the topic of the questions was not yet the focal point. Another assigned holistic code was *PST observations*. Under this code were PST

observations on student engagement with materials, their observations of my interactions with the fifth graders and changes in behavior within their small groups.

Continuing with Saldaña's coding methods, I employed a second cycle (p. 208) of analysis. In this cycle, the coding approach is designed to narrow down the general coded information into specifics that delineate patterns, themes, conceptual ideas, etc. In this analytic cycle, I used focused coding to look for smaller categories within the larger groupings. For example, under the heading of *PST questions*, this led me to more focused codes such as specific questions about application, specific questions about my actions, specific questions about the fifth graders understanding of this process. All data analysis was done using MAXQDA 12 software.

Research questions. Studies such as this one involve specificity and boundedness, a particularity of case studies (Stake, 1995). According to Stake, the true focus of a case study is on the particular and not the general (p. 8). In this case, the particular began by asking the following questions.

What are preservice teacher's attitudes toward the use of the arts as instructional strategies? How can the arts play a role in the pre-professional learning of undergraduate students who are prospective teachers? How can the arts, specifically dance, be used as an instructional strategy for literacy in preservice teacher training? These questions comprise a component of a qualitative research puzzle (Mason, 2002) that begins with a narrative investigation into the academic lives of preservice teachers, their first semester of intensive methods work, and their use of the arts as an instructional tool. The manipulation of the research process as puzzle allowed flexibility and context sensitivity (Mason, 2002) as I entered into the lived experiences of preservice teachers.

Narrative nonfiction, also known as creative nonfiction, is a qualitative storied approach to research. It brings together researched content with conventions of fictional storytelling to thoroughly engage the reader (Sinner, 2013). In the context of this writing, my use of narrative nonfiction rises from the interstitial spaces of autoethnography (Ellis, 2004), performative writing (Pollock, 1998), and narrative inquiry (Clandinin & Connelly, 2004). It is creative in form and craft, but the events are completely factual (Gutkind, 2012). In fact, Gutkind sums up the genre simply as true stories well told (Williams, 2010).

Representation. In this article, I braid the methods of narrative nonfiction, autoethnography, and performative writing throughout the dissemination of my case study findings. This process allows the reader to slide between the academically constructed barriers of fact and fiction (Barone, 2012) and allows the researcher to more personally engage those readers in joint meaning making. This joint process of understanding comes not only from the researcher's perceived findings, but from the overlapping of the reader's interaction with the text itself.

Data were collected through instruction and observation of the preservice teachers as both learners and instructors. Their own thoughts about their journeys were detailed through weekly journal prompts. This article shares a narrative inquiry into the lives of preservice teachers, but also a narrative framing of my growth as a researcher and educator. I am both narrator and character in my research story. Throughout this storied experience, questions of teaching and learning through artful ways of knowing are engaged in conversation with traditional teaching and learning strategies. Each storied section begins with a snapshot of personal experience from either researcher or participants (Sinner, 2013).

Situating the Researcher

Borrowing from a qualitative viewpoint, I situate myself as researcher squarely in the center of this inquiry puzzle (Goodall, 2000; Mason, 2002). My intersectional experiences as a nontraditional student, an interdisciplinary scholar, a single caregiver of an aging parent and an African American female living within and without the educational system combine to bring my unique perspective to interactions with my participants that cannot be disregarded without loss of meaning for the reader (Crenshaw, 1989). My creative foundations as a professional performer and teaching artist, however, drive my vision for student engagement and learning.

The reliance on those creative foundations draws me closer to the paradigm discussed by Haseman (2006) and Bolt (2008). Haseman named a creative engagement with the research process a *performative paradigm* and insists it stands somewhere outside of both qualitative and quantitative models. Excluding many nuances, Haseman explained quantitative and qualitative research processes as ways of examining practice and uses the performative paradigm to fill the void created when practice is no longer the object of study but the method of research (2006). In other words, qualitative and quantitative methods use practice as an observed object rather than seeing practice as a method reflectively observing itself. The span of this project did not allow me to provide a thorough investigation of the ways in which arts-based researchers can or cannot find place within this paradigm.

Whether discovery processes are called creative practice as research, performance as research, research through practice, studio research, practice as research (PaR) or practice-led research, they all tend to lean toward the performative arts (Nelson, 2013) in Australia and the UK. The performative processes are more commonly seen in arts-based research outside the United States, while visual art seems prevalent in education research here in the U.S. (Nelson,

2013). PaR differs not only in the processes and end goals, but the practitioners, the performative artist-scholars, initiate the research puzzle (Clandinin & Connelly, 2004; Mason, 2002) from a vastly different perspective. PaR scholars do not usually start with a specific problem. They start with an excitable interest (Haseman, 2006). For example, we can identify the lack of arts classes in schools as a problem to be addressed, while an interest in PaR might reflectively investigate how the practice of arts educators contribute to the problem.

Performative researchers are not primarily interested in translating their work into more standard forms of representation. The performative researcher feels that true knowledge of the nature of their inquiry, or the knowledge derived from their inquiry, cannot fully be understood if the (re)presentation is not of the same or similar form as the inquiry itself (Haseman, 2006; Nelson, 2013). In other words, much is, or can, be lost in the transference to text. This does not mean that textual, or text-based (re)presentation is completely rejected by PaR practitioners. It does, however, mean that these performative artist scholars take great pains to make sure that the value of the written word is not more than that of the practice itself. In the present study, the (re)presentation is done in a creative nonfiction text to facilitate the reading audience's immersion, as much as possible, into the world of both the participants and the teaching artist.

“Teaching in an art form makes you a teaching artist” (Jaffe, Barniskis, & Cox, 2013, p. 4). When the general public thinks of a teaching artist what commonly comes to mind is what Jaffe et al. (2013) defined as an arts educator working with K-12 students in formal school settings, but a teaching artist is different (McKean, 2006). Teaching artists are difficult to define and can be found in many fields outside education. There is no universally accepted definition of a teaching artist, and no specified training for the people who do this work. There is not even a clear way of becoming one or of advancing along the career path (Booth, 2013, 2015).

However, the definition used by this writer comes from Eric Booth, considered by many to be the father of this profession. He (2015) defined a teaching artist as “a practicing artist who develops the skills, curiosities, and habits of mind of an educator, in order to achieve a wide variety of learning goals in, through, and about the arts, with a wide variety of learners” (para. 5). Teaching artists who focus on arts integration more narrowly seek to provide an equal pairing between arts content and other core curricular learning. The present study fuses dance/movement practice and literacy content while achieving learning objectives in both.

Looking back, what was once the common definition of literacy is now understood as functional literacy (U.S. Department of Health, Education & Welfare, National Institute of Education, 1975). New definitions of literacy include knowledge of, and competence in, multiple areas. Media, digital, computer, cultural, visual, and political literacies are only a few of the multiple literacies identified as necessary in order to successfully navigate the world around us. Paulo Freire pushed beyond printed coding/decoding practices (Freire, 1970; Freire & Macedo, 1987) into an idea of literacy as a critical, reflective, and social justice oriented practice for “reading the world” (Freire & Macedo, 1987, p. 30-32). Lankshear and Knobel (2008) also expanded the conception of literacy including communicative choice through who has the right to communicate and how they choose to communicate. While literacy may have once meant the ability to read and write in order to successfully obtain employment, the expanded definitions of today show more clearly why arts intergration could be a valuable instructional strategy in multiple disciplines.

Within multiple ways of meaning making, there are multimodal ways of sharing information, and multiple intelligences that are processing that information. Teaching through multimodalities (Albers & Harste, 2007) and multiple intelligences (Gardner, 2006) requires a

foundational acknowledgement that speech and text are not the only ways by which human beings communicate, and that speaking/listening and reading/writing are not necessarily the most effective methods of communication. Using the arts in classroom learning environments facilitates these alternative methods of meaning making by introducing an instructional strategy that adds cognitive, emotional, and cultural elements (Mantione & Smead, 2004) which, when integrated with more traditional instructional strategies, can increase comprehension.

Data Collection: Reconstructed/Collapsed Memory

Why is this video camera not working? Is it the outlet? Calm, stay calm. I checked it before I left home though! Ok think, think...I have my little camera and two digital audio recorders. I won't be able to capture their physical movements, but I can put each one on a table and get audio I guess. That might be better actually. Maybe they won't be so self-conscious about moving if they know they're not being recorded on video. I can transcribe their answers to my questions from the audio recordings, and I can write down my impressions and memories about their movement choices as soon as I finish my time with them. Will that be good enough for today's data collection? Oh well, it'll have to do. They're coming back from break so I just ran out of time...

Ladies! Don't sit down! Today we're going to start exploring movement as a learning tool, so we need to stretch a little bit and talk about vocabulary. Start rotating your head while I talk. Watch me for changes in direction and movement. Now, move your shoulders front and back. I understand that you're in your kinesiology class this semester. If I use different vocabulary, please stop and correct me. I'd like to be consistent with what you're already learning. Okay? Great. Remember to watch me so you can see when I change movements. Now pat your arms, (good not too much resistance so far), your upper body, now your lower body...pat your head. Dab! We're going to go over the same body parts, but this time I want you to dab instead of pat. Don't forget your face and your feet. Brush, like you're brushing something off you. (Darn it I forgot the breathing part.) Okay, stop. Take a moment and breath in, reaching out as far as you can. Expand, expand. Now, exhale. Pull your body in to your core as tightly as possible. This is core- distal movement. Inhale and reach out, now exhale pulling in to your core. Now experiment with movements using only your upper body. Now use only your lower body. So far we've only done one type of movement. Does anyone know what it's called? Guesses? Axial! That's right. Can you give me the definition of axial movement? Correct. We haven't traveled. This time you can move only the right side of your body. Now use only the left. What do you think I'm going to ask you to do next? Exactly right. This time move in across yourself with various body parts. Ok come back to center. Deep breath in. Reach out as far as you can. Exhale and pull in to your core. Let's do that two more times. Nice job ladies. Let's have a seat. By the way, that's called the Brain Dance. You can find the official version on YouTube. Any questions about what we've done so far? No? Ok. I'd like to share with you the Kennedy Center's definition of arts integration.

Arts integration is an approach to teaching in which students construct and demonstrate understanding through an art form. Students engage in a creative process, which connects another subject, and meets evolving objectives in both. (para. 1)

How many of you know the 5 Finger Turkey art project (I trace my hand and fingers on the dry erase board and see heads nodding yes)? What about the Cotton Ball Bunny? (I see some confused looks). That's when you pass out a picture of a bunny and glue cotton balls on it. (noticing the nods) Ahhh, now you know what I'm talking about I see. Are either of these arts integrated lessons based on the Kennedy Center definition?

Sandy: *No*

Sheila: *I don't think so.*

TA: *Why not?*

(Students look at each other for answers, but no one says anything for approximately 30 sec., then...)

Sandy: *You just said there had to be objectives in both right?*

TA: *Exactly. What art are you teaching when students make the cotton ball bunny? Nothing, but if I want to introduce 'texture' to them and use this as part of my lesson it can become an arts integrated lesson. With the 5 Finger Turkey, I could include a lesson on 'line', or shading. One of my trainers said that when you do an art activity with children, it's like hitching a boat to the back of the truck. You still have two separate things and neither one really impacts the other. The goal in arts integration is to have a James Bond car. It's a car on dry land, a submarine under the water, and an airplane in the air, but it's still a car. All of those functions work separately, but together they create an entirely different thing. That's what happens in a fully integrated lesson.*

Sandy: *So, you have to have objectives in both subjects?*

TA: *Exactly.*

(Students mumble under their breath.)

Sheila: *This is confusing.*

TA: *What's confusing?*

Ayanna: *Ms. Upshaw, how is this going to help students read better? I don't get it.*

TA: *Ahhhh that's because I haven't completely explained that to you yet. Let's make sure you understand exactly what will happen first, before we worry about the outcomes of what will happen. First, you all will be working with the fifth graders. The teachers want*

to learn how to run literature circles, so you'll go into their classrooms and lead a lit circle for thirty minutes with a group of 3-5 students. You've discussed lit circles with Dr. Wagoner right? Great. In a few weeks, we'll add the arts integration component and you'll have your group for an additional thirty minutes. They're reading an ecomystery called Who Really Killed Cock Robin. We're going to use movement/dance in order to help them make connections. Don't panic! I promise it will not be as bad as you think.

Before you have to teach them, I'll teach you the process I'd like you to use. We'll go step by step. This part is the research that I'm doing for my dissertation. You'll meet with them for thirty minutes and come back here to this classroom. I'll spend approximately forty-five minutes with you teaching you about dance and literacy for the first few weeks. You'll then guide them through the same type of activities during the last thirty minutes of your lit circle. Oh it's time to go. Please don't forget to write down the journal prompt on the board, if you haven't already.

(Oh shoot, I didn't answer the question about how this helps children read better. I know Dr. Wagoner and I agreed that we should let them come to their own conclusions as much as possible, but now I'm second guessing that choice. Hopefully, I can make it clear enough during this process that they'll figure it out easily.)

Arts Integration: Instruction

Arts integration at its best is informed and purposeful learning between at least one art form and another non-arts discipline (Donahue & Stuart, 2008; Silverstein & Layne, 2010). The President's Committee on Arts and Humanities (PCAH), in its 2011 report on arts education, also encourages further development of the field of arts integration through strengthening teacher preparation and professional development. The report also encourages the use of teaching artists in addition to arts educators as ways of improving school environment, achieving learning objectives, and facilitating student engagement (PCAH, 2011).

In addition to the support from the PCAH, the Arts Education Partnership (<http://www.artsedsearch.org/browse-research>) maintains a bank of research activities conducted through and about the arts, as well as their connections to other subjects of interest. In their list of considerations for future research, one of the questions that needed further exploration is how can the arts play a role in the pre-professional learning of undergraduate students who are prospective teachers? This study refines and narrows this question by asking how can arts

integration be used by preservice elementary educators as a strategy for teaching literacy across the curriculum? Further narrowing of my interest led to the question of how can dance be used by preservice elementary educators as an instructional strategy for literacy and meaning making practices?

Dance is a performative and embodied way of accessing, forming, keeping, and sharing knowledge. Phenomenologist Merleau-Ponty (1962) believed that experience is what happens in that space between the mind and body. Dance is visual, often musical, and can be based on text. It is probably the most ethereal of the performing arts. There is no way to capture it in the exact same way every time. For years, dance has been the object of study by anthropologists (Sklar, 1991; Welsh-Asante, 1997); it has only been recently that dance has moved from the object of study to a method of study (Sklar, 1991; Snowber, 2012; Spry, 2001). Even though its intrinsically abstract nature can be a deterrent for researchers, it can be used to create empathy, educate, inform, and provide an embodied perspective otherwise unseen in traditional research presentation and dissemination processes (Leavy, 2014). Many of these same things hold true for dance in the educational arena.

Dance education does not hold performance training as the pinnacle of success.

Specifically, the National Dance Education Organization expresses that

Education in the art of dance engages the artistic processes of creating, performing and critical analysis. These processes require students to read symbol systems, use critical thinking skills, excel in nonverbal reasoning and communication, exchange ideas, work cooperatively and collaboratively with others, and interact within a multicultural society. More comprehensively, education in the art of dance develops kinesthetic and spatial learning as well as intra- and interpersonal knowledge of self and others. (www.ndeo.org, para. 2)

The processes espoused by the NDEO above are the same as sought after by the Department of Education's common core standards (www.corestandards.org) and 21st century

education skills (<http://www.p21.org/our-work/p21-framework>). Why then would we not promote another way for students to approach learning topics that have already been established as important?

Data Collection: Reconstructed/Collapsed Memory

Nice job with Brain Dance today. Let's add on some other movement today. I'd like you to move around the room like you normally do. In a little while, I'm going to ask you to change how you're moving around the room. You will move in the new way until I call out a change. Don't overthink it. Now, move by leading with your elbow. Lead with your bottom. Move in super slow motion. Okay move normally again. Make sure you stay aware of your surroundings. Don't bump into anyone or anything. Move as if you're afraid. Move backwards. Move in a zig-zag fashion. Move in a zigzag fashion, backwards. Move as if you're on Jello. Move as if you're on fast drying cement. Move as you normally do and go back to your seats. Great job ladies.

Now, I'd like you to get into groups according to the classrooms that you're working in. Excellent. I'm going to read through a short passage from the book. The first time, I want you to pay close attention to the verbs.

...the reeds and rushes undulating in the wind like waves on the ocean. Insects flitted above the plants, and the sun sparkled on the water. The marsh was beautiful. He hurried through the red-maple grove... (George, 1992, p. 39)

I'm going to read it through again. This time I want you to make a physical representation of the verbs that you hear. There is no right or wrong way of doing this. Just think about the verb, and try to do something with your body that represents that. Ready?! I'll slow down my reading and emphasize the verbs.

*...the reeds and rushes **undulating** in the wind like waves on the ocean. Insects **flitted** above the plants, and the sun **sparkled** on the water. The marsh **was** beautiful. He **hurried** through the red-maple grove...*

This time, I'm going to ask you to talk with your group and come up with a collective representation of the verbs. Don't forget to incorporate different levels into your response (2 minutes elapse). Are you ready? Just like before, every group moves at the same time... Nice. Once more please. This time only one group will perform. The others will watch until every group has had an opportunity. Who wants to go first?

Arts Integration: Method

How can the arts, specifically dance, be used as an instructional strategy for literacy in preservice teacher training? This question became the topic for my dissertation research as a result of my professional experiences prior to entering my doctoral program. After almost twenty years of working in K-12 classrooms, I found myself very frustrated with the lack of commitment to arts integration by classroom teachers. In personal conversations with me, as a teaching artist in their schools, the teachers acknowledged that art integration engaged students who were not successfully engaged by more traditional instructional strategies. They would praise my work with their students. However, any expectation for them to actually participate drew negative responses from them. They thought using the arts in the classroom was great as long as they were not expected to facilitate that process. Counterintuitively, though, in short-term workshops, they would express the desire to learn more about the process.

The final straw came in a three-year, funded project that provided weekly interaction with students at one elementary school in a mid-sized southeastern city. The sole purpose of the project was providing professional development for teachers so they could at the end of that time implement in-depth arts integration work. Though I and another teaching artist worked in this school weekly and had collected anecdotal evidence of varied success, none of the teachers were capable of designing a fully-integrated lesson at the end of that third year.

An informal program assessment found the classroom teachers reflected a lack of motivation for change. The initial grant design was completed without input from the teachers. They had no say in the structure. Additionally, the grant was written without any ways of enforcing compliance toward the goals. The layers of concern were varied and deep, resulting in my feeling as if I had wasted three years of my time. I knew that integrating the arts in

classroom instruction had been a turning point of success for many of the students that I worked with over the past three years. What was unclear is what needed to be done to establish the changes as the new norms for the classroom teachers.

Data Collection: Jottings

Should the facilitator risk losing the many to reach out to the few? What role do time constraints play into this specific situation? I had an hour during class for two weeks to introduce the concept and then I would not be able to interact with them in an instructional role again. I chose to sacrifice getting full participation in order to make sure the majority had the information necessary to move forward without me. Was that the right choice?

Does implementation of strict ideas of good classroom behavior (sitting still and being quiet) help/hinder the creative process...especially initially? Have they even explored that idea in their other classes yet?

If students feel unprepared to teach a subject, what is their responsibility for changing that state of being? I'm struggling to say this in a ...nice, professional way. There are too many resources available, including myself, for them to get a pass on not understanding and not trying to change that fact.

Why is messy a bad thing? Why must learning be serious and dry in order to be authentic?

It burns me when they talk as if control or focus is somehow going to just drop out of the sky, rather than it being their responsibility to ensure it.

If the PSTs (preservice teachers) had more experience would that have meant less confusion for the elementary students in the literature circles? However, the PSTs themselves had trouble with literal vs. abstract concepts when they were working through their own creative process. PSTs should take note of other PSTs questions and how we get answers/understanding. They didn't, so didn't have a repertoire of responses, didn't think ahead to figure out how to answer students' questions.

Awareness and Understandings

Most of these early journal questions focused on classroom management skills or student engagement. To be more precise, they wanted to know how I was able to control such a large number of students, how could I not be embarrassed to lead movement in front of such a large crowd, and how did I plan to engage students that might be too shy to move? Following up with

other comments, they were very concerned about how they would get the children “under control” or get them to take learning seriously if they allowed them to dance as part of the learning process.

While they understood kinesthetic intelligence in theory, they were ill prepared to actually experience or facilitate it. This was also their first experience in the classroom as an instructor, and creativity is messy and loud. Learning about classroom management and multiple intelligences is very different than actually applying that knowledge in real time. I am not sure what, if anything, I could have done to increase their confidence. Our time was limited, so adding any refreshers on classroom management would have made it even more challenging. I did model some ways that I managed the classroom, but I did not draw special attention to my process. It was not until I began to analyze their journals that I understood how important it was for them to have this directly taught as part of the arts integration lesson.

Early journal entries expressed disbelief that the arts, particularly dance, could be of any benefit in literacy instruction. Participants wondered, as had the student in my first interaction with them, “how applicable is this in a real classroom setting?” There was a cognitive disconnect in seeing their experiences as a part of “real classroom” behaviors. They queried how leading students through a series of movement exercises would need to “change in order to enhance the students' knowledge of literature” and whether students’ learning of literature (will) actually be benefitted, or will they just see this as a way to get out of class and have fun. By the end of the unit, participants expressed ideas in a 180 degree turnaround from these initial concerns.

...during the second week of incorporating the arts integration lesson into our discussion, my students began to pair their thoughts and ideas about the book more abstractly. They told me that because they had think out of the books about movement toward an important phrase of the book, they felt inclined to do the same for discussion...involving

the arts into a reading discussion, it brings a more abstract and complex level of thinking. It pushes students (as well as teachers in this case) to think more critically. There could be a deeper meaning in a phrase or text and a fun way to explore it, is through movement. Based on my student's critical thinking of why we involve movement into our discussion, it gave me a new perspective of thinking to why we use it in readings. Also, I'm beginning to realize that not only do students have fun with it, they are more likely to branch out and communicate... (Janie, journal entry)

I learned that students dancing and creating visual artwork can assist in their visualization of the book. (Suzanne, journal entry)

...is really bringing the quotes from the book to life. The students are thinking of the quotes in ways they have never thought of them before... (Barbara, journal entry)

This was not a new finding for me, but it was for the PSTs. I would often get frustrated with their reluctance to commit to the process. Having a lifetime of mostly positive experiences in the arts and almost 20 years of arts integration specific practice to draw from confidently, I was challenging them to question the status quo of classroom practices (learning can only happen in quiet, still places). However, I did not want them to question my practice. Rather, I did not want them to question my beliefs, which are founded in my practice. This shines a particularly harsh light on my own intractability that may have impeded their learning in some way.

The overarching idea for my unit plan was to lead the preservice teachers through the exact same experience that they would then use to lead the fifth graders. Their experience of arts integration as a learner prior to facilitating the process was, hopefully, a means to demystify the process. I wanted them to remember what it felt like to not know, but to have to follow anyway. I wanted them to remember what it felt like to shine in areas they had struggled before or vice versa.

Only one participant clearly articulated this point. She said, "Over the course of the art integration process, I have found my journey mirrors the children's journey." I found this lone statement particularly interesting. Most of the student teachers did not make the connection. I

did not specifically ask them to do so. The other participants spoke primarily of their observations of change and growth in the fifth graders. They spoke of engaged behaviors within their literature circles and chronicled changes in their own attitudes as well as those of their students. The PSTs, as a rule, did not seem to notice the parallel nature of those journeys.

I gave up a myriad number of opportunities to have a more direct impact upon my participants' process by not making the journaling an interactive process. Their personal connection and reflection was somewhat incidental in my planning process, but to truly gain their commitment to the big idea of arts integration as an instructional strategy, perhaps it should not have been. Perhaps my written responses and deeper questions in response to their journal ideas would have been beneficial by providing them a more directed approach to applying and understanding this new practice.

How to assess creative work is always a question that generates a wide range of views. It is also a question with which educators are often reluctant to engage because of their lack of confidence in artistic content. I mentioned as part of the training process that using the arts as an assessment tool was actually quite practical. The students would not be able to create integrated art works if they did not have a complete grasp of the educational content first.

The PSTs found success in using the arts as an assessment tool surprising.

I could really judge whether or not they understood the literature once they had to apply it to their movements. I was surprised with how well the students picked up on the characters' personalities and progression throughout the novel. When they were stumped by a particular movement or way of expressing something, or even when they were not sure what they wanted to express, I loved watching them collaborate and talk about their personal interpretations or refer back to the text to figure something out. (Sally, journal entry)

...feel like the student have a firm grasp on the book because they knew how they wanted to portray it through their movement piece... (Mary, journal entry)

The PSTs for the most part considered the arts only for their entertainment value. This was true even for those that participated in the arts themselves. At the time of this writing, I feel as if I have something in common with George Washington Carver as he tried to describe all the things that peanuts could be used to create. My own practice provided knowledge and the discovery process led to more practices that led to more information. I cannot be frustrated with preservice teachers' lack of acceptance and understanding when they lack the practice, experience, and time to discover the knowledge for themselves.

Data Collection: Observation Notes

We started the song, "I clap my hands..." Almost no participation from them...even after I reminded them that I wasn't looking for a professional choir sound. There are a lot of blank stares. We began with the Brain Dance and moved from axial to locomotor movements. I reminded them of the available levels (H, M, L) and how that might change the movements. We moved around the space leading with different body parts. I had to remind them again about levels because they immediately did the obvious. I asked them what happened to their movements after I reminded them of levels? One young lady mentioned that they began to "individualize their movements," "move differently from each other." I asked what might be challenging about using this activity in the classroom. One participant mentioned "having a way to bring them back." We talked about the fear of losing control...

Musings

In any good Practice as Research project, answers lead to more questions, more pathways in need of investigation, and more possible futures. What good is it to improve my practice if there is no place for that practice? What can I do with this improved understanding? Where can I employ it and work to further refine it? While this particular study focused on the integration of dance into elementary curriculum, my interest has now broadened to question issues of administrative implementation.

During the course of my inquiry process, I found that my institution only offers a full teacher education program in music. Dance and drama offer one class with a focus on how to work in schools, while visual art has no teacher training classes at all. So, if children are to have

experiences in the arts who does that leave to teach them besides the beleaguered classroom teachers? How can they do that if they themselves have had little or no experiences in the arts? This also seems incredibly short sighted of the colleges involved in the fine arts and in education since most artists will end up teaching others at some point during their careers.

I am not suggesting that classroom teachers be expected to replace arts educators. I think that there needs to be a two-pronged approach, even if I am focused on only one of those. That being said, one of the recurring constraints that impacted this study was time. One of the things I overheard in many of the participants' conversations was that they did not have time. As both student and new researcher myself, I understood how much time could be involved when learning to do something new. As a co-teacher, my advisor and I struggled to find and manage the instructional time we shared. Time is also a regular part of the discussion in educational practices. Time is needed to teach core content, but are not the arts considered core content? On paper, they are considered core content. In reality, they are treated as less than second class citizens in the world of education. How can they truly be core content if we do not consider it a priority to train people to teach them as a stand-alone subject?

Time is also an important consideration from the administrative standpoint. I have been told that at my institution it takes approximately two years to fully integrate one new course into a program. How then could there be a reasonable expectation to include arts integration as a separate course of study in a teacher preparation program?

In all my planning and organizing, I must admit that I never once considered this perspective. I naively thought that just proving that an instructional strategy engaged students and employed multimodal ways of learning would be enough to ensure its place in teacher

preparation programs. Learning that this is not the case, I need to re-vision my work in order to make it a realizable goal within institutional constraints.

Revisioning

Re-visioning through this new awareness of the role of the educating institution led me to my next level of questioning. How can arts integration be successfully embedded into the teacher preparation programs? I began to look at STEM/STEAM programs in K-12 for inspiration. The work of STEM (Science Technology Engineering Math) and STEAM (Science Technology Engineering Arts Math) coordinators in K-12 programs is very similar to that of a teaching artist. They collaborate closely with all teachers in order to plan units/or lessons that utilize STEM/STEAM connections.

An arts integration coordinator as part of a teacher preparation program could function in a similar way. Their job could consist of designing and implementing arts integrated lesson plans in courses that have already been vetted and approved. This would facilitate understanding that the arts can be used in all subject matter: music can be used to teach fractions; visual arts can be used to teach science; and drama can teach social studies. The coordinator would also be able to participate directly in classes on assessment and behavior management.

The participants' continued concerns about staying in control made me wonder if perhaps graduate students might be a better group with whom to work. They might be older and/or have more direct teaching experiences. Even two to three years in the classroom could provide more confidence in their own abilities to facilitate the arts integration process without losing control of their classroom. However, this may take me right back to the issues that brought me into the doctoral program initially. Even if I continue to refine my instructional practices, even if PSTs and classroom teachers acknowledge the value of the arts in their classrooms, what good does

that do their young students if there is no way to provide systematic instruction to new teachers or professional development to those already employed in the field?

Addendum

While the focus of this article is on arts integration and preservice teachers, I am sure that many want to actually know the answer to the question, who really did kill Cock Robin. In order to find out, you will have to read it for yourself (George, 1992).

References

- Albers, P., & Harste, J. (2007). The arts, new literacies, and multimodalities. *English Education, 40*(1), 6-20.
- Andrews, M., Squire, C., & Tamboukou, M. (Eds.) (2013). *Doing narrative research*. London, UK: Sage.
- Barone, T. (2012). Creative nonfiction and social research. In J. G. Knowles (Ed.), *Handbook of the arts in qualitative research: Perspectives, methodologies, examples, and issues* (pp. 106-116). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Bolt, B. (2008). A performative paradigm for the creative arts? *Working Papers in Art and Design, 5*. Retrieved from http://www.herts.ac.uk/__data/assets/pdf_file/0015/12417/WPIAAD_vol5_bolt.pdf
- Booth, E. (2015, February). *A new framework for understanding the teaching artist's field*. Retrieved January 20, 2017, from Eric Booth: <http://ericbooth.net/a-new-framework-for-understanding-the-teaching-artist-field/>
- Booth, E. (2013). *What is a teaching artist?* Retrieved January 1, 2017, from <https://www.carnegiehall.org/DigitalLibrary/Eric-Booth-on-Teaching-Artistry/>
- Clandinin, D. & Connelly, F. (2004). *Narrative inquiry: experience and story in qualitative research*. San Francisco, CA. Jossey-Bass.
- Crenshaw, K. (1989). Demarginalizing the intersection of race and sex: A black feminist critique of antidiscrimination doctrine, feminist theory, and antiracist politics. *University of Chicago Legal Forum, (1)*, 8, 139-167. Retrieved from <http://chicagounbound.uchicago.edu/uclf/vol1989/iss1/8>
- Donahue, D., & Stuart, J. (2008). Working towards balance: Arts integration in pre-service teacher education in an era of standardization. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 24*, p. 343-355.
- Ellis, C. (2004). *The ethnographic I: The methodological novel about autoethnography*. New York: AltaMira Press.
- Friere, P. (1970). *Pedagogy of the oppressed*. New York, NY: Continuum.
- Friere, P., & Macedo, D. (1987). *Literacy: Reading the word and the world*. Westport, CT: Bergin and Garvey.
- Gardner, H. (2006). *Multiple intelligences: New horizons*. New York, NY: Basic Books.
- George, J. C. (1992). *Who really killed cock robin: An eco mystery*. New York, NY: Harper Trophy.

- Goodall, H. (2000). *Writing the new ethnography*. Lanham, MD: AltaMira Press.
- Gutkind, L. (2012). *You can't make this stuff up: The complete guide to writing creative nonfiction from memoir to literary journalism and everything in between*. Boston, MA: Da Capo Press.
- Hancock, D., & Algozzine, B. (2011). *Doing case study research: A practical guide for beginning researchers* (2nd ed.). New York, NY: Teachers College Press.
- Haseman, B. (2006). A manifesto for performative research. *Media International Australia incorporating Culture and Policy: Practice-led research*, 118, 98-106.
- Jaffe, N., Barniskis, B., & Cox, B. (2013). *Teaching artist handbook* (Vol. 1). Chicago, IL: Columbia College Chicago Press.
- Lanshear, C., & Knobel, M. (2008). *New literacies: Everyday practices and classroom learning*. Berkshire, England: Open University Press.
- Leavy, P. (2014). *Method meets art: Arts based research practice*. New York, NY: The Guilford Press.
- Mantione, R., & Smead, S. (2004). *Weaving through words: Using the arts to teach reading comprehension strategies*. Newark, DE: International Reading Association.
- Mason, J. (2002). *Qualitative researching*. London, UK: Sage.
- McKean, B. (2006). *A teaching artist at work: Theater with young people in educational settings*. Portsmouth, NH: Heinemann.
- McTaggart, R. (1991). Principles for participatory action research. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 41(3), 168-187.
- Merleau-Ponty, M. (1962). *Phenomenology of perception*. (C. Smith, Trans.) London, UK: Routledge & Kegan Paul.
- Nelson, R. (Ed.). (2013). *Practice as research in the arts: Principles, protocols, pedagogies, resistances*. United Kingdom: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Peng, R. (2009). Reproducible research and biostatistics. *Biostatistics*, 10 (3), 405-408.
- Pollock, D. (1998). Performing writing. In P. Phelan (Ed.), *The Ends of Performance* (pp. 73-103). New York, NY: New York University Press.
- President's Committee on Arts and Humanities. (2011). *Re-investing in arts education: Winning America's future through creative schools*. Retrieved from <https://www.pcah.gov/publications>
- Riessman, C. K. (2008). *Narrative methods for the human sciences*. London, UK: Sage.

- Saldana, J. (2013). *The coding manual for qualitative researchers* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Silverstein, L., & Layne, S. (2010). *Defining arts integration*. Retrieved January 23, 2017, from [www.kennedy-center.org: http://education.kennedy-center.org/education/partners/definingartsintegration.pdf](http://www.kennedy-center.org/education/partners/definingartsintegration.pdf)
- Sinner, A. (2013). *Unfolding the unexpectedness of uncertainty*. Rotterdam, The Netherlands: Sense Publishers.
- Sklar, D. (1991). On dance ethnography. *Dance Research Journal*, 23(1), 6-10.
- Snowber, C. (2012). Dance as a way of knowing. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 134(Summer), pp. 53-60.
- Spry, T. (2001). Performing autoethnography: an embodied methodological praxis. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 7 (6), 706-732.
- Stake, R. E. (1995). *The art of case study research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- U.S. Department of Health, Education & Welfare, National Institute of Education. (1975). *Reading for working: A functional literacy anthology*. (T. Sticht, Ed.) Alexandria, VA: U.S. Department of Health, Education, and Welfare.
- Walker, M. (1993). Participatory action research. *Rehabilitation Counseling Bulletin*, 37(1), 2-5.
- Welsh-Asante, K. (1997). *African dance: An artistic, historical and philosophical inquiry*. Trenton, NJ: Africa World Press.
- Williams, J. (2010). True stories: An interview with Lee Gutkind. *Symploke*, 18(1-2), 349-366.
- Yin, R. (2003). *Case study research: Design and methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

L'OPERA:

LAYERED OPERATIONS PRACTICING EMBODIMENT, REFLECTION, AND ANALYSIS

Some of my earliest memories involve music. My grandmother sang as she worked around the house, her voice a low soothing alto. My mother's voice is a high light soprano, now thinning with age. Neither of them played an instrument, but Mama decided early on that I would. I started piano lessons in Kindergarten, and as soon as I knew enough I began playing hymns for church. In fourth grade, I took guitar lessons, and eventually ended up playing alto saxophone in the band. The pivotal point in my music career, actually in my life, came when I began voice lessons in the seventh grade.

My first songs, from those lessons, came from what is affectionately known as 'the singer's bible,' The 24 Italian Songs and Arias. I sat at the piano trying to correctly pronounce the words, playing through the notes in the melody, tapping out the rhythms, and visualizing myself on stage with crowds of people applauding. From seventh grade through a master's degree in voice performance, this interaction with text, sound, and visual spectacle has been a cornerstone of my life. Research then takes me where the personal meets the public, and so it begins.

Opera is a lush, extravagant feast for the senses. However, for the majority of the American populace, it only brings to mind wealthy white people in jewels and tuxedos sitting in the dark, stiffly watching a fat lady in a horned helmet singing extremely loudly in a language they do not understand. For me, opera is an experience shared in such a way that my senses are almost overwhelmed with the power of the story. This comfortable (for me) sensual and emotional engagement with narrative through layers of music, text, movement, and visual spectacle challenged me to use my personal experiences in this interdisciplinary art form as a way of learning more during my research process, as well as engaging the reading audience after the fact.

This work is qualitative (Butler-Kisber, 2010; Goodall, 2000) in its acknowledgement of the researcher's context. It is arts-based (Leavy, 2014; Eisner, 2004) in its use of textual,

musical, kinesthetic, and visual methods. It is practice as research (Nelson, 2013; Oikarinen-Jabai, 2003) because it centers my practice as an artist in order to inform my practice as researcher. It is a sensory ethnography (Hurdley & Dicks, 2011; Pink, 2015) as it centers knowing through practice, experience, and perception (Pink, 2015, p. xi) for both the researchers and the participants. It layers operations practicing embodiment, reflection, and analysis. It is L'OPERA.

Opera, in its traditional construct, focuses on the singing of stories. However, when deconstructed, opera's individual components can be examined more intimately. Used here as a layered process of inquiry and analytical reflection, it incorporates movement, drama, visual art, and music (vocal and instrumental) and through these layers establishes as well as investigates the research narrative. Each art form embodies narrative in its own right. Each has its own voice and tells its own story. Each art form engages the senses in a unique way. The undeniable strength of opera as a single entity is how all these separate voices are pulled together to share one story through the engaging of the senses as a way of experiencing the metanarrative. Multiple voices co-constructing an overarching story one narrative at a time.

At times, these voices are heard separately (arias/solos) and at times all together (chorus). Sometimes the voices compete to be heard (duets, trios, quartets, quintets, etc.), and sometimes they let their silences speak for them (instrumental interludes). The same happens in the research process. In the beginning of the research journey, the advisor's solo voice is the most prevalent. Slowly, the researcher/scholar learns enough to contribute and it becomes a duet, sometimes a dueling back and forth until the ideas harmonize and lead to a resolution accepted by both parties. Sometimes there is resolution even if there is no harmony between the parts. The addition of the participants' voices, as in any multi-voiced endeavor, can cause dissonance until

balance is found. In practice as research, stillness and silence are also active parts of the creative process. Often the most profound truths of a narrative seem to be found not in the telling but in the listening.

I suggest that the naturally-layered practices of L'OPERA through text, music, dance, and visual spectacle can, and indeed should hold, a special place in the worlds of practice as research, sensory ethnography, and arts-based research methods. Throughout this article, individual aesthetic processes provide a secondary engagement with the research narrative based upon journal entries, field notes, and classroom observations. These individual artistic inquiries provide insight into the research narrative directly related to the specific process, but it is the layering and depth of sensory information that makes L'OPERA an important addition to the performative paradigm of research practice.

Who Really Killed Cock Robin by Jean Craighead was the title of a book used in a literacy project with fifth graders in a small southern elementary school. A small group of preservice teachers (PSTs) were led through an arts integration lesson plan and then asked to implement a similar plan with the fifth graders in order to investigate the college students' learning process. This article is based on that unpublished work.

Starting with questions from the researcher, participants, and advisor, Layer 1–Text, uses *found poetry* to distill understanding of what questions each group finds particularly important in the research process. Layer 2–Music builds on the rhythm of the found poems to initiate a musical inquisition. Layer 3–Dance moves further into abstraction as the researcher dances an embodiment of the inquiry process. Finally, Layer 4–Visual Spectacle explores visual spectacle through the primary research space, and personal teaching practices.

Layer 1–Text

At the age of 11, I began interpreting the words of long dead poets by rolling words over my tongue in a language I didn't speak. The sounds cascading over my ears were at times fluid, and at other times guttural. The English translation below the original language held the only clues to the meaning I was supposed to make plain. In hindsight, it seems absolutely ridiculous to expect an 11-year old to make meaning of ideals to which she'd yet to be introduced, to understand romantic love she had yet to feel, or to paint a word picture of sights she had not seen.

In my late 20s, I worked with world renown opera diva, Martina Arroyo. It was she who insisted that I do word for word translations of all my foreign language songs. She spoke of nuances in word choices that are missed when relying on a translation that I had not personally done. One opera aria (song) can last as long as 20 minutes. The opera itself, in special cases, can last up to four hours. To do a word-for-word translation of just your role takes hours upon hours of painstaking work. Some of the words are obsolete. You cannot look up verb forms. It was tedious even though I had taken at least a semester of French, German, and Italian. It was tedious, but it made me careful in choosing words to express precisely what I meant in my own language.

Poems are rhythmic, musical entities (Lerdahl, 2001) that can be sung, chanted, whispered or shouted to evoke embodied responses (Butler-Kisber & Stewart, 2009). The poetic in research examines identity, relationship, and community (Leggo, 2008; Prendergast, 2014). Poems can uncover, discover, and report findings (Brady, 2009). There are multiple terms for the use of poetics in research: poetic inquiry (Butler-Kisber & Stewart, 2009; Prendergast, 2009), research poems (Prendergast, 2006), poetic narrative (Ricketts, 2011), ethnopoetics (Blommaert, 2006), poetic portraits (Hill, 2005), and performative autoethnographic poetry (Pelias, 2016) are only a few. For the purposes of this work, I use the general term *poetic inquiry*.

Found poems are one way of making meaning in the poetic inquiry process. Words and phrases from an original text are selected and arranged into poetic context (Burdick, 2011; Lahman, 2014; Pate, 2014). In this sensory study, the original texts for the found poems are pedagogical questions from the researcher's, participants', and the advisor's point of view. They

were collected word for word from memos, field notes, journal entries, classroom discussions, etc. to provide the first step in my poetic inquiry process (see Table 1).

Table 1

Original Texts for the Found Poems

Questions	Original Texts
Researcher's Questions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How can I get the participants past their fear? • How can I get them to see the possibilities? • How can I facilitate more arts driven processing from the student teachers (STs)? • How are they answering their own questions? • What kinds of connections need to be made? • What's the happy medium between observation and application? • Why are they so resistant?
Participants' Questions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How will my students interpret the text? • How does movement help students better understand the text? • Why is dancing viewed as important to literacy? • How can we transition from game to learning? • How is this applicable in a real classroom? • How do you as the teacher help the student who do not visualize the text, see the art, and create ideas from the text? • Will all types of students benefit from thinking in this unique way?
Advisor's Questions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What do University students need to know in order to do what you are asking? • How do we encourage University students to actively engage in the learning experience themselves? • How can we use the available classroom and hallway space effectively for small groups? • Should we introduce topics whole group and then split up, or start with small groups? • How do we encourage University students to speak up in group situations without taking over the groups? • How do we encourage University students to allow the elementary students to experience without providing so much structure and instruction that they are basically telling them what to do?

The second step is to analyze and select words and phrases of importance or impact (see Table 2).

Table 2

Analysis of Select Words and Phrases of Importance or Impact

Questions	Select Words and Phrases
Researcher's Questions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How can I get them past their fear? • How can I get them to see the possibilities?
Questions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How can I facilitate more arts driven processing from the student teachers (STs)? • How are they answering their own questions? • What kinds of connections need to be made? • What's the happy medium between observation and application? • Why are they so resistant?
Participants' Questions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How will my students interpret the text? • How does movement help students better understand the text? • Why is dancing viewed as important to literacy? • How can we transition from game to learning? • How is this applicable in a real classroom? • How do you as the teacher help the student who do not visualize the text, see the art, and create ideas from the text? • Will all types of students benefit from thinking in this unique way?
Advisor's Questions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What do UA students need to know in order to do what you are asking? • How do we encourage UA students to actively engage in the learning experience themselves? • How can we use the available classroom and hallway space effectively for small groups? • Should we introduce topics whole group and then split up, or start with small groups? • How do we encourage UA students to speak up in group situations without taking over the groups? • How do we encourage UA students to allow the elementary students to experience without providing so much structure and instruction that they are basically telling them what to do.

The third step is to take those words/phrases and arrange them, in this case not only to express metaphoric ideas, but also to best establish rhythmic musicality (Butler-Kisber & Stewart, 2009; Butler-Kisber, 2010) for representation later in song form (which is specific to this particular researcher's process) (see Tables 3-5).

Table 3

Researcher's Poem

Version 1	Version 2
See possibilities past fear	Can I help them see possibilities past their fear
Resistant connections	Resistant to connections, they refuse to hear
Answering their own questions	Struggling against knowing, against answering their own questions
Arts driven happy medium	Arts driven happy medium integrated lessons

Table 4

Participant's Poem

Version 1	Version2
Students' movement interpret text	Students' movement interprets text
Teacher helps the student better understand	Unbound and eager to know what comes next
Create unique ideas, literacy transitions to applicable learning	Teacher helps the student better understand How the arts bring learning to hand
See benefit	Create unique ideas literacy transitions to applicable learning Arts integration creates educational yearning See benefit.

Table 5

Advisor's Poem

Version 1	Version 2
UA students need to know	UA students need to know
(How to) actively engage themselves	how to actively engage themselves and so
Use space effectively	To use space effectively
Speak up without taking over	Speak up without taking over collectively
Allow experience without so much structure	Allow experience without so much structure
	Breeding a higher order thinking culture.

I have invested years teaching the arts in non-arts classrooms. That makes the subject of arts integration a very passionate, and also a very personal, one for me. That passion seems to have blinded me to the very real fear that the student teachers were experiencing. I did not realize that I was taking their fearful reluctance to participate in arts activities as a personal rejection. I also realized how shallow my thinking was in comparison to my advisor's depth of vision. My focus was directed toward their participation, or lack thereof, in a particular activity, whereas her questions indicate concerns that would impact their teaching overall.

Layer 2—Music

I don't want to tell my advisor that I think I'm crazy. The voices in my head ask questions, half formulate answers, and wake me in the middle of the night trying to hold a conversation with me. The participants, who resist participating, and their never-ending questions about why this is important irritate me. I don't understand why they don't make the connections with multimodal teaching opportunities, and what they've learned about multiple intelligences. My mind snaps out sarcastic responses that I can never voice while I read their journal responses. Why won't they even try to figure it out themselves? They seem so complacently all-knowing. Then, there are the questions my advisor asks. Where does she come up with these things? How can she be so calm when it feels as if the participants' questions are ripping away at everything that I am? I don't want to think about how to encourage them to

participate in their own learning. It's theirs! They should own it. I'm struggling with how to break it down so they can understand it...even when they don't want to do so. Her questions make me dig deeper, but I still don't have answers yet.

I thought I knew what I was doing. After all, I've been teaching arts integration to teachers for years. Truthfully, I thought I knew the answers before they asked the questions. I realize how little I know, and how much more I could have been doing for those in my workshops. Constantly, these thoughts are in my head. I talk out loud to the articles I'm reading. I talk in my head to the participants' journals. I wonder how I can state things more clearly. I stare blankly at my advisor, and scream internally as she asks me one more thing that I didn't realize I didn't know. No. I don't want to tell my advisor that I think I'm crazy. I have to tell her that I am crazy, or I have to find a way to control the noise in my head.

As part of the research process (inquiry, analysis, representation), music is a late entrant to the world of arts-based research (Dogantan-Dack, 2015), and, in many ways, an underrepresented one (Bresler, 2005; Pink, 2015). This could be considered another example of music's tendency in lagging behind trends and ideologies embraced by other art forms at a much faster pace (Dogantan-Dack, 2015). This slow-moving acceptance of new things by music, and through music, contribute to the dearth of information about music as a research method when compared to other arts-based research methods. (The use of the word method here is not to be confused with traditional music teaching methods and application of instrumental practices.) This has also hampered the creation of its own *practice as research* criteria and tenets, thereby often requiring the genre to rely on parameters used by other arts-based research methods that are not specifically designed for musical idiosyncrasies (Dogantan-Dack, 2015).

According to 20th century composer Edgard Varese (Varese & Wen-chung, 1966), what is music if not organized sounds (p. 18)? This idea of music being the organization of chaotic sounds is my starting place for music practice as research. I can take the unorganized noise of the voices in my head and make them into music. The first thing this idea does is lead to more questions that rattle around in my head, adding to the chaos. How do I compose? Is composition or notation of that composition what I want to focus on? I do not want the music to be simply an

accompaniment. How can I make it an integral part of the inquiry and the representation process?

First, like many practitioner-researchers, I play with this idea (Haseman, 2006; Smith & Dean, 2009; Blain, 2013) of composition as research and how to make music from noise. As an opera singer, I almost never consider music without some type of text, so I begin with the poems I created (Burdick, 2011; Lahman, 2014; Pate, 2014) from the researcher, participant, and advisor questions listed in the earlier section. I also need to consider how music and text intertwine and what are some common points of analysis and understanding. Stephen Brown's work (2000) has suggested that music and language share foundational properties; although in language we move from phonemes to words to phrases, while in music we move from pitches to motifs to phrases. While I can certainly understand that progression, I do not see how it can help me shape music from noise.

As I continue to play with this idea, it comes to me that music and language are both created by sound. A series of stressed and unstressed (strong and weak, or accented and unaccented) beats is what makes up rhythm in music. Patterns of stressed and unstressed syllables in turn create the rhythmic pattern of poetry. These patterns, as well as the duration of those patterns, form a foundation in both genres and will provide the connector needed for this musical exploration. I will use what I know of marking stressed and unstressed syllables in the text. The corresponding lines from each poem are grouped together to indicate how they run as a polyvocalic sound in my head.

In this first notation of words to music, I think of each word as representing a musical beat. The stress and unstressed symbols represent how that beat is divided. I have not accounted for rests (pauses) or the uneven number of beats that throw off the symmetry of the pattern (in a

European musical system). I also have not accounted for odd numbers of syllables within beats, although that is not as difficult. My executive decision not to have nice, neatly tied ends will stand as a metaphor for the voices, which have been corralled into some semblance of order, but there are still some places that are ragged and refuse to conform to this structure. That ragged refusal to completely conform to imposed structure is a mirror of what happens in my thoughts.

It is not enough to continue the cerebral process of transforming noise to music; I must embody this process in some way. To my way of thinking there is no musical instrument more representative of rhythm than the drum, and there is no instrument more representative of polyrhythms than an African drum. The djembe is a type of African hand drum that sounds three distinct core tones when struck: bass, tone, and slap. I used the bass and tone to indicate stressed and unstressed syllables. This connection of African drums and language is not new. The Talking Drums of the Akan people in Ghana are well known for their mimicry of the tonal language of that people (Ong, 1977). However, my project is not an attempt to actually recreate the sounds of language; rather, it is an attempt to affect the reading audiences that hear the resulting product. This process aligns itself more naturally with Winter's (2014) work with Senegalese drumming techniques. He documented that Senegalese drummers often improvise and recite texts they feel reflect the meaning of the rhythms as they are played (p. 644).

At this point, the process is very simple. I used my right hand to play the stressed syllables in the bass register of the djembe, and the left hand played the unstressed syllables in the tone register. After making these somewhat arbitrary decisions, the rest of the process is a matter of practice: aesthetic choices that help turn the work of research into a work of art. I followed by recording each line separately then editing the resulting rhythmic lines into one

musical composition. Below is a notational chart of the process revealing as much of the process in textual form as possible.

Poetry/Drumming Line 1

	- L	- - / - - LLRLL	- L	- L
Researcher	See	Pos/si/bi/li/ties	Past	Fear
	/ - R L	/ - R L	/ - - R L L	/ R
Participant	Stu/dents'	Move/ment	In/ter/pret	Text
	- - L L	/ - R L	/ - R L	/ R
Advisor	U/A	Stu/dents	Need/ to	know

Poetry/Drumming Line 2

	- / - L R L	- / - L R L			
Researcher	Re/sis/tant/	con/nec/tions			
	/ - R L	/ - R L	/ - R L	/ - R L	- - / L L R
Participants	Tea/cher	helps/ the	stu/dent	bet/ter	un/der/stand
	- - L L	/ - - R L L	- / R L	/ / R R	
Advisor	How/ to	Ac/tive/ly	En/gage	Them/selves	

Poetry/Drumming Line 3

	/ - -	-	/	- -	
	R L L	L	R	L L	
Researcher	An/swe/ring	Their	Own	Ques/tions	
	/- - /	- - / - - -	- / - -	/ - - -	/ -
	R L L R	L L R L L L	L R L L	R L L L	R L
Participants	Cre/ate u/nique	I/deas li/te/ra/cy	Tran/si/tions/ to	Ap/pli/ca/ble	Learn/ing
	-	-	- / - -		
	L	L	L R L L		
Advisor	Use	Space	Ef/fec/tive/ly		

Poetry/Drumming Line 4

	/	/ -	- /	/ - -	
	R	R L	L R	R L L	
Researcher	Arts	Dri/ven	Hap/py	Me/di/um	
	/	/ - -			
	R	R L L			
Participants	See	Be/ne/fit			
	/	-	- /	/-	/-
	R	L	L R	R L	R L
Advisor	Speak	Up	With/out	Ta/king	o/ver

Poetry/Drumming Line 5

	- /	- / - -	- /	- -	/-
	L R	L R L L	L R	L L	R L
Advisor	Al/low	Ex/pe/ri/ence	With/out	So much	Struc/ture

The sound of the drum resonates through my body and mind and soul. The rhythm drives me towards more questions, but this time the questions I hear have order. There is a rhythm to my research process driving me, seemingly relentlessly, toward my goal. The rhythm has been difficult to master, but once I feel the flow of it under my hands understanding has come swiftly. Sometimes, feeling the rhythm can lull me into a false sense of security.

I think I know where I am going and then my attention wavers. It is at that exact moment that the next stress or unstressed beat surprises me and causes me to miss something. I am no longer in the flow of the rhythm. Sometimes, it is clear where my mistake lies, and it is an easy path back to my place. Sometimes, the loss of the rhythm forces me to a complete stop. Sometimes, I can never recapture my place and I have to start over.

Layer 3—Dance

I sit here, listening to the silence before the first drumbeat sounds. I feel my breath, deliberately slowing it and controlling it with purpose. Letting go of the tension in my shoulders, eyes closed as I type blindly, I wait. There it is. Finally, I hear—no, feel—my heartbeat. In other writings, I've shared stories of my intersectionalities: woman, poor, Black, educated, daughter, caregiver, no longer a wife, and never a mother. These storylines center in various parts of my body, but they all are connected by the beat of my heart. That beat, now affected by the call from the drums, beats back in response. The drums call me back. They call me back through a life in the Western arts. They call me back through a childhood of barely understood Africanisms transformed into Southern truths. The sound of the drums calls my heart back to a knowing in my body, knowing through my body, knowing with my body. The drums call, and my body's response is knowledge on display. My body knows things.

Body

Feet flat on the floor represent the connection to Mother Earth. Even when jumping, the goal is to return to Mother as soon as possible. Knees bent, flat back, body low to the ground, again to stay close to Mother...where it is safe. Back arching repeatedly, feet slide in a three-step pattern, palms up, hands gliding outward from center through each three step pattern. Shoulders roll and head turning side-to-side following the dominant foot in the pattern. Right foot slide forward, holding weight on bent knee, left foot lifts to 90⁰ angle from the floor, arms fly back like wings, hands flexed with palms turned out, head and eyes straight forward. Left foot down slightly ahead of the right with both knees bent, hands cupped return to chest, head looks over left shoulder in a movement reminiscent of Sankofa, the Adinkra symbol for "return and get it." Repeat.

The body responds to the polyrhythmic call of the drum with polycentric movement. Polycentric movement, as part of an African dance aesthetic, is one body, multiple parts with individualized moves, using a variety of energy levels across space through time (Welsh, 2001; Nelson, 2013). Unlike European dance aesthetics, which promote movement arising only from one central core, the core of African movement may begin from any body part, and multiple centers of movement may operate simultaneously and in harmony (Welsh, 2001).

Energy

*Feet flat on the floor... my weight **pressing down into** the connection to Mother Earth. Even when jumping **powerfully**, the goal is to return to Mother as soon as possible. Knees bent **loosely**, flat back **suspended in preparation**, body curved **low** to the ground, again to stay close to Mother...where it is safe. Back arching **sharply** repeatedly, feet slide **weighted** in a three-step pattern, palms up, hands gliding **smoothly** outward from center through each three-step pattern. Shoulders roll **sensuously** and head turns **snake like** side-to-side following the dominant foot in the pattern.*

Think of energy as the adverb of dance movement. It brings the picture into clearer focus for the reading audience and can also be used to provide metaphorical information for the reading audience. The energy used in a dance varies from dancer to dancer, and often is prescribed by the choreographer. In this case, both are one and the same. I emphasized the pressing down quality of my initial footwork to indicate that I have reconnected to what grounds me (DeFrantz, 2004; Willette, 2012). The physical energy required to lift my overweight body off the ground demands power. If I am to provide structure and order from the noise and chaos, I must strive to move powerfully through that which holds me immobile both in the dance and in my research process. The looseness of bent knees prepares me for leaving the protectiveness of contact with the Earth and protects me from being overwhelmed by the power of my landing as I return. This looseness reflects my interpretations as I move through qualitative data in search of

the performative paradigm (Haseman, 2006). There is comfort in staying where it is safe. Dancing with both feet on the ground is much safer than leaping up and challenging the pull of gravity. There is even greater comfort in knowing that once we have found and recognized that safe place, we can always return. Suspended in preparation represents a waiting period, or a pause in the intake of information. I walk away from my analysis and come back. For me, there is a type of stillness before an understanding arrives even when I am not doing an artful inquiry. It is how my body and mind work together. Low body curves which arch sharply the pull of knowing that has no more patience for my need for safety. Knowing weighs me down even as it integrates itself into my paradigm. The sensuous snake like movements acknowledge acceptance of a new normal (DeFrantz, 2004; 2011).

Space

Feet flat...weight pressing down...jump...back flat...body curved...low...back arch...slide feet...hands glide...shoulders roll...head snakes... There's a problem with my spacing. Even as the drum rolls and my movements begin, I realize that I have not incorporated the physical space around me purposefully. My direction, levels of interaction, and pathways seem happenstance. I did not choose my direction or pathway with intent, nor did I choose steps that would provide a variety of levels throughout the movement. As I moved through the physical space around me, there was no consideration of how the space would, and did, influence my moves. This was also true of the research project. It never occurred to me to question or alter our physical space in any way, or that something like that might be used to positively impact the participant's experiences.

Space and spatial awareness play an important role in the arts: dance (Mainwaring & Krasnow, 2010), poetry/text (Knowles, Schaffner, Weger, & Roberts, 2012), music (Lissa, 1964), and visual art (Amheim, 1956). They can also be important parts of the research process as well. The space around the body and the objects within that space impact how, where, and when the body can move. The interdisciplinary spaces through which I make meaning from my data impact my academic space as well. As the lone performer in this artistic process my primary relationship is not to other bodies, but rather to things found in the physical space

around me, both real and imagined. Couches, chairs, hardwood floors, and walls impact my concrete space, but the memory of desk configurations, and carpet shape my movement as well. However, as the lone researcher, I am in constant relationship, physically and metaphysically, with my participants and advisor. Their questions impact how, when, and where I move through the space of my dissertation.

Time

Time. Timing. Temporality. Narrative Time. Susa Time. Zamani Time. Embodied Time. Clock Time. Calendar Time. Duration. Which type of time provides an appropriate interrogation of this part of my work? Clock time in the classroom was limited. Participants met once a week for 2 hours and 45 minutes in a class focused specifically on children's literature. At various stages in my 45 minutes each week, they had to complete a combination of the following activities: a) learn foundational information about arts as a classroom instructional strategy; b) experience a similarly directed arts learning experience based on the text they would later use with the elementary students; c) work in classroom groups to design their approach; d) create an integrated lesson plan; and e) ask and answer questions.

When providing direct instruction to the elementary students, they were expected to facilitate discussions of an assigned reading section for 30 minutes and then lead their small group of students (usually 4) into movement explorations of meaning and understanding. After they returned to their own classroom, there were rarely more than 15 minutes for them to debrief and ask their own questions. Many of them used their journals to ask questions and circumvent the lack of time in the classroom for that process. Although the parameters of time were taken into consideration during the planning stages, embodied time made the experience very different than what it looked like on paper.

Body, Energy, Space, Time (BEST) while known to me as an instructional strategy was new to my practice in artistic inquiry. It seems that, with each layer of inquiry, the benefits of intersecting multiple intelligences and multimodal instructional strategies become more apparent. Each artistic operation engages with the practice and process of my research by leading me through different ways of knowing and understanding. My body knows things.

My dance has no true resolution. It simply stops because I ran out of time. In a similar way, my research is filled with unanswered questions. Questions that I did not, or could not, answer in the time allotted this project. I moved through the research practice somewhat oblivious to the impact that those unanswered questions would have until now. How did my body move through the classroom space? How did my energy affect time? How did the physical space impact the preservice teachers' creative process? As an artist, I may not have time to correct the dance, but as a researcher I must continue to investigate those questions and their potential impact on my growth in educational investigations.

Layer 4—Visual Spectacle

Entering the school building requires passing through two sets of locked doors. Passing through the second set, you're greeted with a changing display of children's artwork on the table in the medium sized foyer. Turning left and passing through another set of heavy doors, the floor begins to slant downward at a rather steep angle. Sounds become muted the further down you walk. By the end of the hallway, there is absolute silence. The teachers call this the ghost hall, but try not to let the students hear them say so. Only the classroom used by the preservice teachers is in use. The rest seem to be filled with extra desks.

Looking through the classroom door, there is nothing special that draws your attention or sparks your curiosity. The classroom itself might be considered large if not for the desks and tables. Twenty desks are pulled together to form four table groupings in the middle of the room. Orienting myself in the doorway, straight ahead are medium sized windows, but the primary light in the room comes from harsh overhead lights. Underneath the windows, stand an upright piano and a table with a computer and printer. Looking further to my right along the same wall is a small table with two chairs that I use when videotaping the entire class. The wall to my far right has a dry erase board covering most of the space. There are some book cover posters scattered over the top and sides of the board.

The wall adjacent to the door and on my immediate right is taken up with a long counter that my advisor and I use to manage handouts and supplies. There is a small closet that holds cleaning agents and butcher paper. The left wall holds a large SMART (electronic) board. It's connected to the computer and allows the instructor to write on the 'board' and save it like a MS Word document. It should also function as a video display for digital learning, but the internet connection has never worked consistently in this room so we never use it for that.

One of the most difficult things to describe to anyone that has never been to the opera is the immense spectacle (visual impact) (Pendle, 1971; Coeyman, 1990; McGeary, 1993) framing the flow of voices interwoven with lush orchestral sounds. Pictures of major international opera houses (The Metropolitan Opera House, The Sydney Opera House, The Houston Grand Opera, etc.) confirm that the visual impact flows from the architectural design of the building through the staged set to the singers' costumes, makeup, and physical presence. The inquiry of this layer is two-fold: a) how can the physical space impact the learning process; and b) how can my own "larger than life" attitude as teacher/performer have impacted that process as well.

First, what is the narrative of the visual spectacle as told by the physical location of our classes (Theresa, 2012)? How does that location impact, positively or negatively, on the learning process (Gallese & Lakoff, 2005; Hurdley & Dicks, 2011)? On the participants' creative thinking? Is it even important? The first thing to acknowledge about this particular space is that there is nothing outstanding about it. It looks similar to the many other classrooms that I have encountered throughout my work in elementary schools across this country. (That, in and of itself, poses a problem in hindsight. If I wanted the participants to understand that these learning strategies were not simply more of the same, perhaps their first clue should have been a difference in the physical space they inhabited for the course of this project.)

The majority of research on this topic seeks to correlate physical environment and teacher/student attitudes toward learning (Lackney, 1994; Higgins, Hall, Wall, Woolner, & McCaughey, 2005; Martin, 2002). However, the details in my classroom description overlap

with what Barrett, Davies, Zhang, and Barrett (2017) call lighting, ownership, flexibility, and color. They list these elements as impactful on the classroom's learning environment in one of the few empirical studies attempting to connect physical environment with educational outcomes. They found that natural lighting, originality in the room's character, personalizable spaces, well defined zones for specific learning activities, and the use of bright colors all had positive impacts to varying degrees on reading, writing, and math learning. Most of these elements were not within my control, and unfortunately it did not occur to me to make changes in the areas that were. The next area of interest regarding visual spectacle requires a much more intensely personal examination. While this particular element was directly under my control, it still did not occur to me that changes might be needed.

Having started voice lessons at 11 years of age, I have always moved through the world as someone capable of holding people's attention without a microphone. I have accustomed myself to people's critique of my clothes, my speech, my voice, my hair, and my weight. I have acclimated to other people's uneasiness around my comfort in the spotlight. I considered all these personal attributes a plus when I began my work as a teaching artist (Booth, 2013; Jaffe, Barniskis, & Cox, 2013). While teaching is often spoken about through metaphors of performance (Prendergast, 2008), I use the idea quite literally. When I teach, I consider it a type of performance with students as my audience. This follows along Schechner's (2001) process that does not abandon my original understanding of performance, but rather places it in relation to my work in the classroom.

It is difficult to acknowledge the often unrealized difficulty that this can present when training new teachers. They have not yet garnered the experience (confidence) to be themselves, or know the selves that they want to present in their role as teacher (Heyning, 2011). I am a

professional performer cast in the role of teacher. These participants did not know their lines for non-arts integrated teaching, and I was asking them to dance as an instructional strategy. They thought I was asking them to copy my method of delivery rather than the intent behind it, and like many who are untrained in an art form, they were reluctant to make a mistake.

As a professional artist, I learned that the audience should never be able to delineate my mistakes or the even work behind the spotlights. Performance should always seem effortless. As a teacher, I acknowledge that we learn from both our personal mistakes and those of others. Seeing me work through the craft of teaching, behind the scenes mistakes and all, could have made them less fearful of making their own mistakes. As a researcher, I was reminded of the power of the physical environment to impact the learning process. I was also reminded that I have a responsibility to take every opportunity, no matter how small, to direct that impact for the positive.

Conclusion

As an interdisciplinary practice based researcher (Nelson, 2013; Riley, 2013) working through a performative paradigm (Haseman, 2006) to provide a sensory exploration of data, this process was never about adding or discovering empirical knowledge in the case study. It has always been about the practices, my personal and intuitive knowings, as well as the drawing in of the reading audience into those processes.

In Layer 1- Text, the *found poems* reveal similarities between myself and the participants. We were frustrated. We were frustrated for different reasons, but the same emotion was the result. In the midst of the research *practice*, I understood their resistance as a personal attack on my beliefs. I wanted them to question what others had told them, but to truly invite their questions towards, and even disagreements with, my own practices made me angry and hurt.

Through the poetry, I was able to claim a positive space as an insider/outsider (Dwyer & Buckle, 2009; Blythe, Wilkes, & Halcomb, 2013) and see more clearly how my actions added rather than detracted from their frustrations. I wanted them to take ownership of their own learning, but did not have time to carefully instruct them on how to do that. I wanted them to be invested enough in their own learning process to try and answer their own questions. I forgot that they are products of the very educational system that I believe the arts should be involved in changing. They did not have the skills or the confidence, contrary to how I viewed their attitudes, to wrestle with the information in that way.

Some participants had less difficulty with the idea of using dance in the classroom. By the end of the arts integration process, many had moved toward a better understanding of what I was trying to do, but I have to wonder how I could have better managed my own constraints in order to help them. What if I chose to answer their questions, rather than wait to see if they would do it themselves? What if I required them to share their questions with each other, and encouraged increased levels of peer mentoring (Cornu, 2005)? How could my being more purposeful in my reflective practice (Schön, 1987) during the process have helped them move closer to an ensemble of individuals working together to increase literacy practices for their own students? In Layer 2- Music, I am gently reprimanded for my adversarial thoughts revealed by the poetry. It occurs to me that building community with my participants and directly facilitating their increased participation in their own learning would have improved the experience for all.

As a practitioner, I am more than comfortable with the content that I shared with my participants; however, as a researcher I found myself working against my own understandings because I could not cite others with more academic knowledge in this area. I could only provide evidence from my 17 years of practice and hands on learning. As a new researcher, I found

myself constantly crossing the line between my knowings from my own practice and what I could prove or document through others' theories and practices.

Layer 3—Dance reminds me not to stop. The only way to the other side is through, and the only way through is to keep moving. Throughout the data collection, analysis and writing process, I have been overwhelmed by the amount of information. Afraid that my skills were inadequate, afraid that my arts-based approach was too non-traditional to be accepted, afraid that I was taking on more than I could handle, afraid of so many things, I was often paralyzed and incapable of doing anything. The use of polycentric motions reminds me that there does not have to be one center of information in order for understanding to occur. I was reminded that as easily as I am able to control the varied and specific movements in different parts of my body, I am able to control the varied and specific information from academic, personal, and professional intersections. That recognition of my own agency frees me from the paralysis of fear. Had I explored my data in this way during my process, I wonder if I could have shared something to help my participants move past their own fears? This should have been a partner dance, but I often treated it as a solo performance.

Layer 4—Visual Spectacle facilitates a reflection who I am as a teacher and how that impacts the learning process around me. I have a very flamboyant style of teaching, and I am comfortable being labeled an extrovert. However, it has taken this process to allow me to see that while engaging and entertaining, my style of teaching can also become a barrier to learning. In most instances, I do not have a consistent place to teach. However, even as a visitor to spaces, I can take the opportunity to engage with my physical environment in order to set the stage for a creative learning practice.

Like persons that have lost one of their senses (sight, hearing, taste, etc.), the body finds ways to compensate for that lack of sensory information. Usually one, or more, of the remaining senses is strengthened in some way. However, the body was meant to function in the world with all senses in tact. The world of research requires informational input from both body and mind. Researchers and participants are meant to experience the research process using the fullness of both, though often it is skewed toward the information only gathered with the mind. The input from bodily knowledge often remaining unacknowledged and left out of the data collection process altogether (Conquergood, 2002).

As a educational researcher, I collected data in many different forms (video, journals, field notes, memos, etc.) in order to best understand the process that I initiated. As an arts-based researcher, I recognize that any one of these artistic investigations would have been enough on its own to provide some semblance of the sensorial impact to my research. However, layering operations that practice embodiment, reflection, and analysis in each individual art form provided a more complete picture of the research experience. As each art form provides its audience a specific and profound experience, L'OPERA gathers those specific profundities and simultaneously establishes and reveals them together in a spectacle of knowing unrivaled by each individual strand.

References

- Amheim, R. (1956). *Art and visual perception: A psychology of the creative eye*. Oakland, CA: University of California Press.
- Barrett, P., Davies, F., Zhang, Y., & Barrett, L. (2017). The holistic impact of classroom spaces on learning in specific subjects. *Environmental Behavior*, 49(4), 425-251.
- Blain, M. (2013). Composition-as-research: Connecting Flights II for clarinet quartet- a research dissemination methodology for composers. *Music Performance Research*, 6, 126-151.
- Blommaert, J. (2006). Applied ethnopoetics. *Narrative Inquiry*, 16(1), 181-190.
- Booth, E. (2013). *What is a teaching artist?* Retrieved January 1, 2017, from <https://www.carnegiehall.org/DigitalLibrary/Eric-Booth-on-Teaching-Artistry/>
- Brady, I. (2009). Foreword. In M. L. Prendergast (Ed.), *Poetic inquiry: Vibrant voices in the social sciences* (pp. xi-xvi). Rotterdam, The Netherlands: SENSE Publishers.
- Bresler, L. (2005). What musicianship can teach educational research. *Music Education Research*, 7(2), 169-183.
- Brown, S. (2000). The musilanguage model of music evolution. In N. Wallin, B. Merker, & S. Brown (Eds.), *The origins of music* (pp. 271-300). Cambridge, ME: Massachusetts Institute of Technology.
- Butler-Kisber, L. (2010). *Qualitative inquiry: Thematic, narrative and arts-informed perspectives*. London: Sage.
- Butler-Kisber, L. & Stewart, M. (2009). The use of poetry clusters in poetic inquiry. In M. Prendergast (Ed.), *Poetic inquiry: Vibrant voices in the social sciences* (pp. 3-12). Rotterdam: Sense.
- Burdick, M. (2011). Researcher and teacher-participant found poetry: Collaboration in poetic transcription. *International Journal of Education & the Arts*, 12(SI 1.10).
- Conquergood, D. (2000). Rethinking elocution: The trope of the talking book and other figures of speech. *Text and Performance Quarterly*, 20(4), 325-341.
- Cornu, R. (2005). Peer mentoring: Engaging pre-service teachers in mentoring one another. *Mentoring & Tutoring: Partnership in Learning*, 13(3), 355-366.
- DeFrantz, T. (2011). Theorizing connectivities: African American women in concert dance. *The Journal of Pan African Studies*, 4(6), 56-74.
- DeFrantz, T. (2004). The black beat made visible: Hip hop dance and body power. In A. Lepecki (Ed.), *Of the presence of the body: Essays on dance and performance theory* (pp. 64-81). Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press.

- Dogantan-Dack, M. (2015). *Artistic practice as research in music: Theory, criticism, practice*. Surrey, England: Ashgate Publishing.
- Dwyer, S. D., & Buckle, J. L. (2009). The space between: On being an insider-outsider in qualitative research. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 8(1), 54-63.
- Eisner, E. W. (2004). What can education learn from the arts about the practice of education. *International Journal of Education & the Arts*, 5(4), 1-13.
- Gallese, V., & Lakoff, G. (2005). The brain's concepts: The role of the sensory-motor system in conceptual knowledge. *Cognitive Neuropsychology*, 22, 455-479.
- George, J. C. (1992). *Who really killed cock robin: An eco mystery*. New York, NY: Harper Trophy.
- Goodall, H. (2000). *Writing the new ethnography*. Lanham, MD: AltaMira Press.
- Haseman, B. (2006). A manifesto for performative research. *Media International Australia incorporating Culture and Policy: Practice-led research*, 118, 98-106.
- Heyning, L. (2011). "I can't sing!" The concept of teacher confidence in singing and the use within their classroom. *International Journal of Education & the Arts*, 12(13), 1-28.
- Higgins, S. Hall, E. Wall, K. Woolner, P. & McCaughey, C. (2005). *The impact of school environments: A literature review*. London, United Kingdom: The Design Council.
- Hill, D. (2005). The poetry in portraiture: Seeing subjects, hearing voices, and feeling contexts. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 11(1), 95-105.
- Hurdley, R., & Dicks, B. (2011). In-between practice: Working in the 'thirdspace' of sensory and multimodal methodology. *Qualitative Research*, 11(3), 277-292.
- Jaffe, N., Barniskis, B., & Cox, B. (2013). *Teaching artist handbook* (Vol. 1). Chicago, IL: Columbia College Chicago Press.
- Knowles, K., Schaffner, A., Weger, U., & Roberts, A. (2012). Reading space in visual poetry: New cognitive perspectives. *Writing Technologies*, 4, 75-106.
- Lackney, J. (1994). *Educational facilities: The impact and role of the physical environment of the school on teaching, learning and educational outcomes*. University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee, Center for Architecture and Urban Planning Research, Milwaukee.
- Lahman, M. R. (2014). Appropriated poetry: Archival poetry in research. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 20 (3), 344-355.
- Leavy, P. (2014). *Method meets art: Arts based research practice*. New York, NY: The Guilford Press.

- Leggo, C. (2008). Astonishing silence: Knowing in poetry . In J. Knowles, & A. Cole (Eds.), *The Sage Handbook of the arts in qualitative research* (pp. 165-174). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Lerdahl, F. (2001). Sounds of poetry viewed as music. *The Annals of the New York Academy of Science*, 930(1), 337-354.
- Lissa, Z. (1964). Aesthetic functions of silence and rests in music. *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, 22(4), 443-454.
- Mainwaring, L. M., & Krasnow, D. H. (2010). Teaching the dance class: Strategies to enhance skill acquisition, mastery and positive self-image. *Journal of Dance Education*, 10(1), 14-21.
- Martin, S. (2002). The classroom environment and its effects on the practice of teachers. *Journal of Environmental Psychology*, 22(1-2), 139-156.
- McGeary, T. (1993). Shaftesbury on opera, spectacle and liberty. *Music and Letters*, 74(4), 530-541.
- Nelson, R. (Ed.). (2013). *Practice as research in the arts: Principles, protocols, pedagogies, resistances*. United Kingdom: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Oikarinen-Jabi, H. (2003). Toward performative research: Embodied listening to the self/other. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 9(4), 569-579.
- Ong, W. (1977). African talking drums and oral noetics. *New Literary History*, 8(3), 411-429.
- Pate, J. (2014). Found poetry: Poetizing and the 'art' of phenomenological inquiry. *Research Methods Cases*. doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.4135/978144627305013512954>
- Pelias, R. (2016). Writing autoethnography: The personal, poetic, and performative as compositional strategies. In *Handbook of Autoethnography* (pp. 384-405). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Pink, S. (2015). *Doing sensory ethnography*. (2nd Ed.) London, UK: Sage.
- Prendergast, M. (2014). I contain multitudes: The challenges of self-representation in arts-based educational research. *International Journal of Education & the Arts*, 15(SI 2.2), 1-16.
- Prendergast, M. (2009). Poem is what? Poetic inquiry in qualitative social science research. *International Review of Qualitative Research*, 1(4), 541-568.
- Prendergast, M. (2008). Teacher as performer: Unpacking a metaphor in performance theory and critical performative pedagogy. *International Journal of Education & the Arts*, 9(2), 1-19.

- Prendergast, M. (2006). Found poetry as literature review: Research poems on audience and performance. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 12(2), 369-388.
- Ricketts, K. (2011). *The suitcase, the map, and the compass: An expedition into embodied poetic narrative and its application toward fostering optimal learning spaces*. (Unpublished Doctoral dissertation). Simon Fraser University, Burnaby, British Columbia.
- Riley, S. (2013). Why performance as research? A US perspective. In R. Nelson (Ed.), *Practice as research in the arts: Principles, protocols, pedagogies, resistances* (pp. 175- 187). London, UK: Palgrave MacMillan.
- Schön, D. (1987). *Educating the reflective practitioner: Toward a new design for teaching and learning in the professions*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Smith, H., & Dean, R. (2009). Introduction: Practice-led research, research-led practice towards the iterative cyclic web. In H. Smith, & R. Dean (Eds.), *Practice-led research, research-led practice in the creative arts* (pp. 1-38). Edinburgh, Scotland: Edinburgh University Press.
- Theresa, R. (2012). From Mephistopheles to Melies: Spectacle and narrative in opera and early film. In J. Joe, & R. Theresa (Eds.), *Between opera and cinema* (pp. 1-18). Abingdon, UK: Routledge.
- Varese, E., & Wen-chung, C. (1966). The liberation of sound. *Perspectives of New Music*, 5 (1), 11-19.
- Welsh, K. (2001). Commonalities in African dance: An aesthetic foundation. In *Moving history/dancing cultures: A dance history reader* (pp. 144-51). Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press.
- Willette, E. (2012). The africanist aesthetic in american dance forms. *Interrogating Dance Globalization*, 13.

CONCLUSION:

CACOPHONY

I come from a place.

I go to a place.

I am that I am.

Three strands not easily broken

Over and under, under and over,

Gather, and begin again.

Artist, Researcher, Teacher

Intersecting and overlapping

Each strand strengthening the braid

That I am

That I am.

I understand now, not then

So young, yet bound in ways not their own

Learning to fly, afraid of their wings

Tentative moves, resisting the call

Bodies on a narrow path of delight and fear

Courage taught through smiles of the young.

I am that Teacher

That I am.

Tools for the craftsman

Voice for the voiceless

Vehicles for narrative

Embedded throughout

Dance their story

Sing my story

Find her story

Paint our story

It's embedded throughout.

I am that Researcher

That I am.

3 against 2 against 4

Complicate words in my head

It pounds, and my body picks up the beat

*The rhythm drives the knowing
Sight unseen
It pounds, and my body picks up the beat
Complicate words in my head
3 against 2 against 4*

*I come from a place.
I go to a place.
I am that I am.*

*Three strands not easily broken
Over and under, under and over,
Gather, and begin again.
Artist, Researcher, Teacher
Intersecting and overlapping
Each strand strengthening the braid
That I am
That I am.*

*I am Artist.
I am that I am.
I am Researcher.
I am that I am.
I am Teacher.
I am that I am.
I am that I am.*

I am that I am.

(Larke & Upshaw, 2017)

REFERENCES

- Ausburg, T. (2006). *Becoming interdisciplinary: An introduction to interdisciplinary studies* (2nd ed.). Dubuque, IA: Kendall/Hunt Publishing.
- Austin, J. L. (1975). *How to do things with words*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Barone, T., & Eisner, E. (2012). *Arts based research*. Los Angeles, CA: Sage.
- Bolt, B. (2008). A performative paradigm for the creative arts? *Working Papers in Art and Design*, 5. Retrieved from http://www.herts.ac.uk/__data/assets/pdf_file/0015/12417/WPIAAD_vol5_bolt.pdf
- Booth, E. (2013). *What is a teaching artist?* Retrieved January 1, 2017, from <https://www.carnegiehall.org/DigitalLibrary/Eric-Booth-on-Teaching-Artistry/>
- Boylorn, R. (2013). *Sweetwater: Black women and narratives of resilience*. New York, NY: Peter Lang.
- Boylorn, R. M., & Orbe, M. P. (2014). *Critical autoethnography: Intersecting cultural identities in everyday life*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Chase, S. (2011). Narrative inquiry: Multiple lenses, approaches, voices. In N. Denzin, & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *The Sage handbook of qualitative research* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Clandinin, D., & Connelly, F. (2004). *Narrative inquiry: Experience and story in qualitative research*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Clandinin, D., & Connelly, F. (2000). Narrative understandings of teacher knowledge. *Journal of Curriculum and Supervision*, 15(4), 315-331.
- Ellis, C. (2004). *The ethnographic I: The methodological novel about autoethnography*. New York: AltaMira Press.
- Ellis, C., & Bochner, A. (2006). Analyzing analytic autoethnography: An autopsy. *Journal of Contemporary Ethnography*, 35(4), 429-449.
- Graff, H. J. (2015). *Undisciplining knowledge: Interdisciplinarity in the twentieth century*. Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Gray, R. (2003). Performing on and off the stage: The place(s) of performance in arts-based approaches to qualitative inquiry. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 9(2), 254-267.

- Griffiths, M. (2011). Research and the self. In M. Biggs, & H. & Karlsson (Eds.), *Routledge companion to research in the arts* (pp. 141-151). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Gutkind, L. (2012). *You can't make this stuff up: The complete guide to writing creative nonfiction from memoir to literary journalism and everything in between*. Boston, MA: Da Capo Press.
- Harris, A., & Holmann-Jones, S. (2016). *Writing for performance* (Vol. 5). Rotterdam, The Netherlands: SENSE.
- Haseman, B. (2006). A manifesto for performative research. *Media International Australia incorporating Culture and Policy: Practice-led research*, 118, 98-106.
- Jaffe, N., Barniskis, B., & Cox, B. (2013). *Teaching artist handbook* (Vol. 1). Chicago, IL: Columbia College Chicago Press.
- Irwin, R., & Springgay, S. (2008). a/r/tography as practice based research. In M. & Cahnmann-Taylor (Ed.), *Arts-based research in education: Foundations for practice* (pp. 103-124). Routledge.
- Leavy, P. (2014). *Method meets art: Arts based research practice*. New York, NY: The Guilford Press.
- Mason, J. (2002). *Qualitative researching*. London, UK: Sage.
- McNiff, S. (1998). *Art-based research*. London: Jessica Kingsley.
- Nelson, R. (Ed.). (2013). *Practice as research in the arts: Principles, protocols, pedagogies, resistances*. United Kingdom: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Newell, W. (1998). Professionalizing interdisciplinarity. In W. Newell (Ed.), *Interdisciplinarity: Essays from the literature* (pp. 529-563). New York: College Board.
- Pace, S. (2012). Writing the self into research: Using grounded theory analytic strategies in autoethnography. In N. McLoughlin, & D. Brien (Eds.), *TEXT Special Issue: Creativity: Cognitive, Social and Cultural Perspectives*, 1-15.
- Pollock, D. (1998). Performing writing. In P. Phelan (Ed.), *The Ends of Performance* (pp. 73-103). New York, NY: New York University Press.
- Repko, A. (2012). *Interdisciplinary research: Process and theory* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Silverstein, L., & Layne, S. (2010). *Defining arts integration*. Retrieved January 23, 2017, from [www.kennedy-center.org: http://education.kennedy-center.org/education/partners/definingartsintegration.pdf](http://www.kennedy-center.org/education/partners/definingartsintegration.pdf)

- Sinner, A. (2013). *Unfolding the unexpectedness of uncertainty*. Rotterdam, The Netherlands: Sense Publishers.
- Smith, H., & Dean, R. (2009). Introduction: Practice-led research, research-led practice towards the iterative cyclic web. In H. Smith, & R. Dean (Eds.), *Practice-led research, research-led practice in the creative arts* (pp. 1-38). Edinburgh, Scotland: Edinburgh University Press.
- Snowber, C. (2012). Dance as a way of knowing. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 134(Summer), pp. 53-60.
- Spry, T. (2001). Performing autoethnography: an embodied methodological praxis. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 7 (6), 706-732.
- Stake, R. E. (1995). *The art of case study research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Upshaw, A. (2018a). Blurred lines and broken kinship: The poetry collection. *Manuscript submitted for publication*.
- Upshaw, A. (2018b). The ridge. *Manuscript submitted for publication*.
- Upshaw, A. (2017a). Battles of wounded me: An atonal cantata. *Manuscript submitted for publication*.
- Upshaw, A. (2017b). My body knows things: This black woman's storied theory in performative autoethnography. In D. Bolen, S. Pensoneau-Conway, & T. and Adams (Eds.), *Doing Autoethnography* (pp. 55-65). Boston, MA: Sense Publishers.
- Weber, S. (2014). Arts-based self-study: Documenting the ripple effect. *Perspectives in Education*, 32 (2), 8-20.
- Williams, J. (2010). True stories: An interview with Lee Gutkind. *Symploke*, 18(1-2), 349-366.
- Yin, R. (2003). *Case study research: Design and methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

APPENDIX A:
IRB APPROVAL

THE UNIVERSITY OF ALABAMA® | Office of the Vice President for
Research & Economic Development
Office for Research Compliance

August 7, 2017

Diane Carver Sekeres, Ph.D.
Department of Curriculum and Instruction
College of Education
The University of Alabama
Box 870232

Re: IRB # 15-OR-370-R2 "Aesthetic/Creative Literacies in Elementary Preservice Teacher Training"

Dear Dr. Sekeres:

The University of Alabama Institutional Review Board has granted approval for your renewal application. Your renewal application has been given expedited approval according to 45 CFR part 46. Approval has been given under expedited review category 7 as outlined below:

(7) Research on individual or group characteristics or behavior (including, but not limited to, research on perception, cognition, motivation, identity, language, communication, cultural beliefs or practices, and social behavior) or research employing survey, interview, oral history, focus group, program evaluation, human factors evaluation, or quality assurance methodologies.

Your application will expire on August 6, 2018. If your research will continue beyond this date, complete the relevant portions of the IRB Renewal Application. If you wish to modify the application, complete the Modification of an Approved Protocol Form. Changes in this study cannot be initiated without IRB approval, except when necessary to eliminate apparent immediate hazards to participants. When the study closes, complete the appropriate portions of the IRB Study Closure Form.

Should you need to submit any further correspondence regarding this proposal, please include the above application number.

Good luck with your research.

Sincerely,



Stuart Usdan, PhD.
Chair, Non-Medical Institutional Review Board
The University of Alabama

358 Rose Administration Building | Box 870127 | Tuscaloosa, AL 35487-0127
205-348-8461 | Fax 205-348-7189 | Toll Free 1-877-820-3066